

**18<sup>th</sup> Joint Review Mission**  
**Action Taken Report on Recommendations of 17<sup>th</sup> Joint Review Mission**

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
<p>With immediate effect, shift programme emphasis to learning outcomes. This should find reflection in future AWP&amp;Bs. In consultation with relevant stakeholders, adopt a revised format for future JRM Aide Memoires that addresses 'Learning Outcomes' specifically.</p>	<p><b>1. Defining Learning Out Comes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NCERT is working towards developments of learning indicators for class- I to Class VIII</li> <li>• Five States - Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Karnataka, Madhya Pradesh Uttar Pradesh have developed learning Outcomes / Learning indicators</li> <li>• States are working towards integrations of syllabus &amp; CCE through definition of learning outcomes / indicators.</li> </ul> <p><b>2. Measuring Learning Outcome</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Additional Secretary, MHRD in her letter to the States for issues concerning the AWP&amp;B 2013-14 has advised the States among other things, to accord the utmost important on quality aspects;</li> </ul> <p>“RTE Act expectations must form the core of SSA AWP&amp;B with respect to improving quality outcomes. Therefore all quality interventions in SSA must be pieced together for a comprehensive State lead strategy to improve quality. Strategies may include separate interventions for primary and upper primary classes. Piecemeal funding of interventions will not be agreed to. Provisions for outcomes to be measured should be included in the AWP&amp;B (i)</p>	<p><b>No comments received from JRM Members</b></p>

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<p>continuous and comprehensive evaluation systems for all grades (ii) developing systems for tracking teacher attendance (iii) measuring school performance over the academic year (iv) measure of teachers' properly completing the academic year's full curriculum (v) conduct of a State study on measuring student learning achievement levels (like the NAS of NCERT or any other model) to promote cross-district comparison and an informed picture of State trends in learning levels.”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NCERT has completed two round of achievements survey for Classes –III, V &amp; VII/VIII, and in the third round Class V completed and classes III &amp; VIII is in process and will compete by March 2014.</li> <li>• Following states are at different stage of conducting of one or more than one round of achievement Survey of children learning - Andhra Pradesh, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Gujarat, Karnataka , Kerala, Orissa,</li> <li>• For Year 2013-14 all states / UT are planning to conduct achievements survey of children's learning levels in all district ( except UP in 10 district only )</li> </ul> <p><b>3. Ensuring learning out come through CCE</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CCE has been implemented in 26 States /UTs, these states/UTs are at different level of implementation of CCE</li> </ul>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Remaining 9 states / UTs are in the process of implementation of CCE</li> <li>• States like UP, Chhattisgarh, Rajasthan and Kerala have conducted rigorous pilot work to articulate module of CCE</li> <li>• States like Maharashtra, Chhattisgarh, UP, Rajasthan have provided more than 5 days teachers training on CCE before implementation.</li> </ul> <p>States are doing following activity for conducting CCE in the class room</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Preparation of Child profile and cumulative record</li> <li>• Utilization of carefully design activity for evaluation</li> <li>• Use of various tool &amp; technique to know children such as – observation , questioning in class room etc</li> <li>• Use of paper pencil test for formative as well as for summative evaluation</li> <li>• Utilizing information gathered through evaluation for improvement in teaching learning</li> </ul> <p><b>4. Monitoring learning out comes</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is a established mechanism for Quarterly review by TSG of approved programmes for quality by PAB</li> <li>• NCERT review Quality Monitoring Tool and it is implemented after revision, the tool are</li> </ul>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<p>already shared to states in Secretary Conference in Jan 2013.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>State have their own School Evaluation Mechanism for example Prtibha Parva- in MP, Gunotsav in Gujarat , Sambalan in Rajasthan , Shamiksha in Odhisa . Other States are in process of developing their own evaluation Mechanism.</li> </ul> <p>5. <b>Joint Review Mission on six monthly basis</b> - Analysis of Learning Achievement results and status of operationalisation of C.C.E is shared with JRM.</p>	
<p>Considering that SSA is a national priority, maintain levels of expenditure during the 12th Plan period as per projected needs. This is essential if momentum is to be maintained and initial investment protected and consolidated. It needs to be emphasised here that on the success of the SSA the RMSA is dependent. High transition rates from elementary education, disaggregated for girls and boys, are necessary for RMSA to achieve its goals. Good quality pass outs from our elementary education schools are essential to sustain secondary education in a meaningful manner.</p>	<p>The fund releases and expenditure under SSA is entirely based on the annual allocation made by planning commission and Govt. of India. As per the indications available the allocation under SSA for the 12<sup>th</sup> plan is more than the allocation made during 11<sup>th</sup> plan period.</p>	
<p>For outcome based planning, programme monitoring and reporting: make increasing use of graphical, time series, data that focus on programme outputs and outcomes and which</p>	<p>The requirement has been noted for compliance</p>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
<p>clearly illustrate trends. Support the presentation of data in this way, by including commentary on the implications of the data for policy makers and implementers and especially in regard to any programme adjustments that might be necessary if targets are to be met.</p>		
<p>Promote inter-departmental coordination and increasing synergies with relevant Government Ministries and ancillary programmes. The latter is especially with regard to health and water and sanitation practices and provision. Student malnutrition in particular is a priority area of concern and this impacts on student well-being and learning potential.</p>	<p><b>This ministry is emphasizing the States for increasing synergies with relevant Government Ministries /Departments for effective convergence of and ancillary programmes especially with respect to Water and Sanitation . Secretary –SE&amp;L on May 13,2013 has requested the Education Secretaries of all states/UTs to forge coordination with state NRHM programme for developing a detailed common action plan to cover all government and aided schools and also suggested States to give wide publicity about facility under Rashtriya Bal Swasthya Karyakram(RBSK),a child health screening and early intervention services programme,under National Health Mission(NHM)</b></p> <p>Also, in case of CWSN, convergence has been established with Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment and the statutory bodies (e.g RCI and ALIMCO) both at the State and National level.</p>	
<p>Gender and gender related capacity building should inform the whole system and should not be confined to girls’ education only. A strategy and plan for gender mainstreaming across all components and for all levels would contribute</p>	<p>Government policy in the last decade, especially through Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), has made inclusion an important part of its agenda.</p> <p>MHRD recognizes that the issue of gender cuts across</p>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
<p>to this and should be reflected in all SSA planning, monitoring and reporting.</p>	<p>categories of disadvantaged groups as well as weaker sections will also require separate and renewed efforts. Subsequently, under SSA, the state's are also adopting similar strategies for planning, monitoring and reporting so that the required capacity is build and whole system could be informed. The RTE Act 2009 also outlines critical issues related to quality, equity and a need to ensure that educational space is discrimination free which requires addressing gender and social equity within a framework that is holistic and is not confined to the girl's education only.</p> <p>In the light of the recommendation on Gender made by the JRM, in order to further move ahead in the suggested direction the following efforts are being made;</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The MHRD has taken up issues of mainstreaming gender concerns through planning, monitoring and reporting in the conference of State Education Secretaries and discussed that there is need for systemic change to ensure that all classroom material and transaction is free from discrimination and bias.</li> <li>2. It is expected that the AWP&amp;B should give a comprehensive description of how this will be reflected in <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Curriculum, syllabus and teaching learning material developed by the State for regular</li> </ul> </li> </ol>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<p>classroom transaction, and for Special Training for out-of-school children,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Classroom practices adopted by teachers, head teachers, resource persons, and educational administrators at various levels through development of appropriate training designs,</li> <li>▪ Management and administration of all incentives and provisions, whether in the form of textbooks, uniforms, mid day meals or scholarships, transportation, etc. from the perspective of child rights and entitlements, rather than as ‘incentives’,</li> <li>▪ Training programmes for teachers and members of SMCs, PRIs, etc. to enable them to address such issues in their School Development Plans.</li> </ul> <p>3. During this period, Union Secretary and Additional Secretary have send DO letters to State and urge them to ensure Re-examination of Curriculum, Text Books, In-service teacher training, modules etc, for developing positive materials.</p> <p>4. National level workshops for the capacity building of district level functionaries on gender and equity have already been organised in which Social access, participation, retention, achievement and completion were discussed. The aspects of Quality</p>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	concerns, Curriculum, Textbooks, Teaching-learning materials, the use of space in the classroom, infrastructure in the light of gender mainstreaming were also discussed.	
NUEPA, NCERT, SCERT, DIETS and the TSG are important resource institutions that play a vital role in supporting SSA. Consider making their roles and functions in respect of SSA an area of particular focus for a future JRM, as this may provide insights as to how their roles and contributions can further be strengthened and supported.	<b>Noted</b>	
Procurement and accounting practices need to be strengthened in their totality. This would include, inter alia, finalisation of PAB Minutes on time.	<p>The recommendations of the 17<sup>th</sup> JRM relating to Financial Management and Procurement were discussed in detail with the State Finance Controllers during the 36<sup>th</sup> Quarterly Review meeting of State Finance Controllers held on 31<sup>st</sup> January 2013 at New Delhi. A power point presentation on all the recommendations of the 17<sup>th</sup> JRM relating to Financial Management and Procurement both at National level and State level was made to the participants urging them to take further follow up action. The highlights and the copy of the presentation are included in the Minutes of the 36<sup>th</sup> Quarterly Review Meeting of State Finance Controllers.</p> <p>The Aide Memoire of the 17<sup>th</sup> Joint Review Mission</p>	



Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<p>was uploaded on MHRD's website. The same was also shared with the State Project Directors of SSA vide MHRD's letter No. F.12-1/2013-EE.13 dated 21<sup>st</sup> February 2013 for taking necessary action. In addition, the Mission's findings and recommendations on Financial Management &amp; Procurement were also shared with the State Project Directors on 21<sup>st</sup> May 2013 and urged them to take immediate action on all issues.</p> <p>In regard to strengthening of accounting and procurement practices, the States have been requested to take the following specific actions: -</p> <p><b>(i) Accounting practices need to be strengthened in their totality:</b></p> <p>States/UTs have been instructed to ensure the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Maintenance of the books of accounts and registers prescribed in Para 52 of the Manual including cash book, advance register, stock register, asset register at all levels.</li> <li>(b) Annual physical verification of stock and assets</li> <li>(c) Regular preparation of Monthly bank reconciliation statement</li> <li>(d) Take effective steps to liquidate advances</li> </ul>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<p>and obtain utilization certificates from districts and sub district level units</p> <p>(e) Advances are not included in expenditure.</p> <p>(f) Introduction of computerized accounting system, if it is not already in use and dispense with the manual system of accounting after stabilizing fully the computerized system of accounting.</p> <p><b>(ii) Strengthening of Procurement</b></p> <p>(a) Para 111.1 of the Manual provides that it is mandatory to follow the prescribed procurement procedure for all the procurements under SSA. The States try to ensure that the prescribed procurement procedure is strictly followed at all levels for all procurements under SSA. The position is rigorously reviewed in the Quarterly Review Meetings of State Finance Controllers.</p> <p>(b) States have been requested to take follow up action on priority on various procurement related observations made during the concurrent financial review by IPAI and annual statutory audit by CA firms.</p> <p>(c) The annual procurement plan is to be</p>	

Key Recommendation	Action Taken	Comments
	<p>prepared on receipt of the PAB Minutes for the AWP&amp;B for 2013-14 and uploaded on States' SSA website by mid August 2013.</p> <p>(d) In order to provide hyperlink on MHRD, SSA website, States to provide the relevant web page link for accessing the annual procurement plan from States' web site.</p> <p>(e) The procurement software to monitor the progress of procurement of contracts of above Rs. 10 lakh was hosted in a dedicated web site i.e. <a href="http://www.rte-ssaprocedurement.com">www.rte-ssaprocedurement.com</a>. States to use the same extensively for monitoring the progress of procurement.</p> <p>The progress of action taken by the States on all aspects mentioned above is reviewed regularly in the Quarterly Review Meetings of State Finance Controllers.</p> <p><b>(iii) Finalization of PAB Minutes in time</b></p> <p>Last meeting of the PAB to consider the AWP&amp;B for 2013-14 was held on 22-4-2013. The PAB Minutes of most of the States were issued by 31-5-2013 and the remaining PAB Minutes are in the process of finalization.</p>	

<b>Key Recommendation</b>	<b>Action Taken</b>	<b>Comments</b>
In view of the specialised nature of the work in regard to financial management and procurement, it is recommended that a dedicated team should be organised for the same in the next JRM. Members of the team should be available for the entire duration of the Mission.	The recommendation has been noted for compliance.	