

Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan: 19th Join Review Mission

KARNATKA STATE REPORT

January 2014

Aid de Memoir

A. Background:

As part of the 19th Joint Review Mission (JRM) of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), a two member team of Mr K. M. Acharya, Mission Leader and Ms Amrita Patwardhan, Mission Member (both GoI nominees) visited Karnataka from January 15 to 18, 2014 to review implementation of SSA in the state. The visit comprised of meetings with the state SSA and Department of Education led by SSA State Project Director (SPD) and Principle Secretary - Education, field visits to Dharwad and Bagalkot districts comprising of meetings with DIET Principals and Faculty, DDPIs and other SSA officials, Block and Cluster Level Resource Persons, visits to Lower and Upper Primary Schools, KGBV, residential school for urban deprived and bridge course for out of school children before mainstreaming, visit to Children with Special Needs catered through Home Based Education (HBE) and Block level Inclusive Education Resource Centre (IERC) and so on. The Mission also had interactions with RIE, Mysore representative pertaining to its role as Monitoring Agency of SSA in the state, select NGOs partnering with the state such as SPIC-MACAY and Agastya Foundation and other department representatives from Mahila Samakhya, Social Welfare and Women and Child Development etc. The Mission would like to place on record, the cooperation and support received by the SPD and his team for making our visit meaningful, promptly providing additional requested information before the de-briefing meeting and effectively facilitating the field visits.

B. Overview and Key issues:

Karnataka is among better performing states on key educational parameters and compliance with Right to Education norms. As per the Composite Educational Development Index 2012-13 based on DISE data, calculated by NUEPA, it ranks 5th across 35 States and Union Territories. However, it is also worth noting that its Composite rank has dropped from 2nd to 5th between 2011-12 and 2012-13 and has dropped rather drastically in case of Upper Primary Schools (UPS) with regard to Outcome Index from 2nd to 13rd and Access Index from 8th to 16th. In case of Primary Schools, barring drop from 12th to 15th on Teacher Index, its Access index is stable at 2nd and almost stable for Outcome Index at 4th between 2011-12 and 2012-13

Karnataka has excellent infrastructure as per DISE, reflected in its 2nd Rank on Infrastructure Index during 2011-12 and 2012-13 for Primary Schools and 1st Rank in case of Upper Primary Schools.

Key observations of the Mission were:

- (i) It was apparent that Karnataka has made significant progress with regard to first three goals of SSA pertaining to enrolment, retention and bridging social gap.
- (ii) Karnataka is making sincere efforts to meet the last mile challenge in the state, though has considerable regional variation on several indicators to address.
- (iii) Karnataka has started a number of initiatives to enhance quality of teaching learning in classrooms. However, learning levels of children in primary and middle schools, as per government and independent studies, is a cause of concern. This appears to be the central challenge for the state.
- (iv) Closely linked to children's learning, is the issue of need for stronger systems to provide teacher support. While CRC-BRC structure in the state is present across 34 educational districts and 203 educational blocks, robust academic support to enable teachers to perform optimally is not in place.
- (v) A significant shift of focusing on outcomes pertaining to quality and equity is needed, as against focusing on procurement, and inputs. There are large number of 'activities' being done and volumes of data being collected and collated. The State however needs to focus on analyzing data to inform planning and implementation of programmes to ascertain if satisfactory outcomes within the Right to Education framework are being achieved and how system can be made responsive to learner needs, with special focus on those who are marginalized.
- (vi) Need for greater convergence between SSA under the Department of Education and other departments with related or overlapping mandates such as Health, Social Justice, Women and Child Development, Tribal Welfare, Social Welfare, Drinking Water and Sanitation, Rural Development, Panchayati Raj, cannot be over emphasizes. SSA goals cannot be met if pre-conditions to learning are not met. This is an area that requires significant attention and action.

C. Status against key goals

Following section outlines status, progress and key issues with regard to achieving 4 major goals of SSA.

Goal 1: All Children in School

Key Observations and Recommendations

1. Discrepancy in NER and other reporting as per DISE and State: Karnataka has NER of 87.8% at the Primary level and 74.5% at the Upper Primary level as against the National average of 90.7% and 64.2% (DISE, 2012-13). The state however reports NER of 97.6% and 94.8% for Primary and Upper Primary for the same period (Karnataka SSA briefing

document for JRM, 2014). This Significant discrepancy is on account for different population projection for 6-14 age group.

It is recommended that Karnataka resolves discrepancy in key statistics such as NER with DISE. Same population projection method needs to be used to avoid mis-match in figure and ensure comparability of data.

2. Near universal coverage: Karnataka has 60,984 elementary schools of which 75.7% are run by government (DISE 2012-13). Share of government schools to total number of schools is at par with national average of 75.9%. Karnataka has achieved universal access to its 60,888 habitations by ensuring 97% habitations have access to primary school within 1 km radius and almost 98% with access to Upper primary in 3 km radius and rest covered through transportation. State is still transitioning from middle school coverage from grade 7 to 8 and hence access to grade 8 in stipulated proximity requires addition of standard 8 in 1,412 schools.
3. Out of School Children: State's original estimation of 22,741 OoSC children has been drastically revised based on detailed survey undertaken by the state in November 2013. This was done due to directive given by the High Court in response to a PIL filed by a NGO. While survey results are being finalized, working estimate of OoSC is now over 2 lakh children. Only 52% of the original estimate of OoSC were brought back to school during 2013-14 and hence revised estimate will require a whole new plan for bringing children back to schools and keeping them in schools. This appears to be an important area of work for the state in the coming year.

A comprehensive plan for mainstreaming OoSC to schools is required, in light of large number of OoSC children identified by the survey done by the State. Mechanisms to identify children, at risk of dropping out and providing additional support is equally important.

4. Single teacher schools: The state still has 7% single teacher schools (national average 8.6%) at elementary level. 14.9% of the Primary schools in the state are single teacher (national average 11.7%)

Schools by medium of instruction: Majority of the schools in the state are Kannad, through the State also has 6 more languages as shown in the table below (Government of Karnataka, Analytical report 2012-13).

School Type	Kannad	English	Urdu	Tamil	Telugu	Marathi	Hindi	Total
Primary	88.17	1.39	8.68	0.13	0.12	1.3	0.19	100
Upper Primary	75.91	14.97	6.57	0.29	0.16	1.91	0.19	100

5. Pupil Teacher Ratio: The state has favourable PTR in schools at 23.5 for elementary as a whole. PTR stands at 15.5 for Primary Schools and 26.2 per class for Upper Primary Schools. (Government of Karnataka, Analytical report, 2012-13). There is a considerable variation in PTR across districts with PTR of 13 to 14 in Chikkamangalore, Hassan, Uttar Kannada on one end, PTR ranging from 31 to 36 in Yadgiri, Bellary and Koppal. 5 out of the 9 Special Focus districts in the State have PTR above 23. The Mission visited classrooms that had PTR of 30+, going upto 55 in one Lower Primary School and witnessed considerable overcrowding in classrooms.
6. Teacher vacancies: the state has around 10% vacancies in teacher appointments. No recruitment of teacher posts has taken place for last two years due to legal issues (Karnataka JRM, briefing meeting, Jan 2014). There are 22,872 vacancies at the elementary level with Raichur, Gulbarga, Belgum (Chikkodi), Bellary and Bagalkot with higher vacancies ranging from 1,531 to 1,010 per district and minimum vacancies in relatively urbanized districts of Bangalore North, South, Dharwad, Udupi and Kolar (less than 300 vacancies per district).

Teacher vacancies and teacher re-deployment needs considerable attention, as this is contributing to regional imbalance.

7. Infrastructure: Karnataka schools are well equipped with basic infrastructure such as girls' toilets in 99% schools, electricity (90%), play grounds (76%), compound wall (63%), water (99%) and libraries (96%) (Government of Karnataka, Analytical report 2012-13). Ramps are reported to be available in 79% elementary schools. The Mission however did not see any properly constructed ramps with hand railings during its visit.

In case of infrastructure, while provision is done in most schools, focus needs to move to ensuring adequacy, functionality and usage of the facilities provided. Need for disabled friendly toilets, cleanliness and usability of all toilets, quality of drinking water, arrangement for hand and plate washing post MDM, low cost play material on the playground needs to be focused. Tried and tested ideas such as Building as Learning Aids (BaLA), provision of storage space inside classrooms for increasing teaching learning area and effectiveness in classrooms are possible areas on which focus in the coming years.

Goal 2: Bridging the Social Gap (Gender, SC/ST/Minority and CWSN)

Key Observations and Recommendations

1. SC/ ST/ Minority: State has 16% SC population, 7% ST population and 12% Muslim population (Census 2011). Enrolment rate of SC, ST and Muslim children in school is higher than the population share with marginal increase or stability in enrolment over last 2-3 years. This is a positive trend.
2. Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya (KGBV): State has 71 KGBVs with almost 98% seats filled. While representation of SC and ST girls was satisfactory at 29% and 14% respectively, representation of Muslim girls was low at 6.7%. Mission was heartened to visit KGBV in one of the districts where girls were received academic and co-curricular inputs, appeared articulate and engaged. Girls also proudly exhibited their skills in Karate and self defense with confidence. There were issues of overcrowding and since hostel for class 9-10 girls under RMSA may take time, alternative arrangements to improve space and infrastructure is required. A number of KGBVs require improvement in facilities as reported by RIE, Mysore as part of SSA monitoring.

Special efforts are needed to increase enrolment of Muslim girls in KGBVs.

Considering positive outcomes of KGBVs, ways of drawing lessons from the same to apply to other middle schools where majority of girls in the state are studying, as well as schools run by Tribal Welfare and Social Welfare would be important to dwell on.

Out of 9 Special Focus Districts, Dakshin Kannad is the only with over 20%. KGBVs have rural outreach. However, Karnataka has several urban concentrations of Muslims¹ and hence care needs to be taken to ensure deserving urban girls are not left out.

3. Children with Special Needs (CWSN) identification: As per 2011 census there are 2.1% disabled persons in the population. The state has identified 127,553 CWSN children between 6 to 14 age group, who comprise of 1.4% children against the total student enrolment in Primary Schools and 1.2% in Upper Primary.
4. Home Based Education (HBE): 7,315 severely disabled children receive HBE through 2,447 volunteers. Mission noted that HBE had reached out to children from marginalized backgrounds, who are unable to come to school. However, it was also observed that optimum rehabilitation, is possibly not being achieved for these children, at present.

¹ See Annexure I

Optimum rehabilitation of CWSN children covered under HBE requires detailed, planning, close coordination with Health and WCD and allocation resources. Arrangement for referrals, provision of funds for accessing best possible medical and rehabilitative services needs to be put in place as that is pre-condition to successful inclusion and learning children.

5. 89% CWSN are enrolled in regular schools (SSA Karnataka brief for JRM, 2014). We recognize that this is an important step forward. However, nature of training, resource material, and onsite support provided to regular teachers to work with CWSN appeared extremely inadequate at present. Since provision for Inclusive Education Resource Teachers who were providing onsite support has also been pulled back, there is virtually no systematic provision for planning, teaching and supporting CWSN children in schools.
6. 40% Braille textbooks have still not been provided to totally blind children in the final quarter of the academic year in January. In one of the districts visited by the Mission, Braille books that were distributed to some children had reached them in December, again very late in the academic year.
7. State estimates that around 35,449 CWSN require aids and appliances. Only 6,250 i.e. 17% received have received appliances. Reason stated for this significant shortfall is fund availability. However comprehensive planning, liaison with sister departments such as Health and Social Welfare was missing.
8. Monitoring agency report and briefing also underlined that teachers and schools are not ready to receive and optimally support development of CWSN children in classrooms.

Non provision or delay in provision of Braille textbooks is due to inadequate capacity of Braille press in Mysore. Significant qualitative improvement of provisions, inputs, teaching learning, resource material provision and onsite support required for ensuring learning and development of CWSN children in classrooms. The entire system needs to be geared to support CWSN children and her class teacher and a comprehensive plan needs to be developed, informed by nature and type of disability present in a given block / clusters.

Goal 3: All Children are Retained

Key Observations and Recommendations

1. Dropout rate in the state for the upper primary is 5.4% and 2.6% for primary and marginally higher for girls at 5.6% and 2.8%. However, dropout rate of ST children is a significant cause of concern with 12.7% (13.3% for girls) for Upper primary and 8.7% (8.9% for girls) (Government of Karnataka, Analytical report 2012-13).
2. Retention rate in primary (grade 1 to 5) is 91.6% and transition rate from 5 to 6 is 94%. Transition rate for ST children is 87% (as low as 54% in Gulbarga). State reports extremely low transition rate for general category students from grade 5 to 6 in some districts like Bijapur 35.9%, Kodagu 59% which is much lower than transition rates of SC/ST/Muslim children in these districts. (Government of Karnataka, Analytical report 2012-13).

Validity of the data needs to be crosschecked and necessary action taken, as required.

3. Similarly, while transition loss from grade 7 to 8 is at 6.5% for the state, same is as high as 31% for Yadgiri for girls and above 10% in five more districts of north east Karnataka i.e. Gulbarga, Bidar, Raichur, Koppal, Bijapur (Government of Karnataka, Analytical report 2012-13).

Necessary action, including completing up-gradation of UPS till grade 8 needs to be completed.

Given significant inter district and possibly inter block variation, it is suggested that planning process be responsive to these regional disparities. It is also observed that while data flows from school to the state and above, analysis of the trends, causes, anomalies that need attention usually do not flow back at block / cluster or school level. Mission recommends the state to explore how district /block/ cluster specificity can be built into the planning process and autonomy within a larger framework of accountability developed to address the issue.

4. The State has defined OoSC children as those absent in the school for 7 days as against MHRD definition of children absent for 45 days. While state definition is meant to reduce time taken to bring irregular children back to school at an early date, processes worked out to take corrective measures are not entirely clear. Role of SMCs (still called SDMCs in Karnataka) would be crucial in this regard.
5. Student and teacher attendance: The state reports attendance of children to be highly satisfactory at 97% in 2012-13 (Additional documents provided by SSA Karnataka to

JRM, Jan 2014). As per the Study of attendance of students and teachers by MHRD student attendance in Karnataka is 89.1% for primary and Upper primary against national average of 76% and 77.8% respectively (MHRD draft findings, 2014, provided to JRM). As per the same study, teacher attendance is estimated at 80.4% for Primary and 79.4% for Upper Primary. While student attendance ranges from excellent to satisfactory as per the above two studies, there may be regional and seasonal variation in attendance. For example, year long study of a north eastern district in Karnataka suggests that student attendance is fairly low at 64% and teacher attendance was 82% (KSU, 2010). Student absenteeism was higher in early primary grades i.e. 41% in grade 1 and 2 while 25% in class 8. The study noted significant variation in student absenteeism, within cluster / schools and as well as seasonal variation. The points at need to identify and address school and community specific issues, including activating School Development Committees. During the visit, Mission noted attendance varying from 71% to 91% in select classrooms visited.

Satisfactory student and teacher attendance is a precondition of achieving education of satisfactory quality. This would be an important indicator to monitor with help from SMCs.

6. School Monitoring Committees (SMC)²: 86% of the elementary schools in the state have SMCs constituted (MHRD, 2014, Right to Education, the third year). Against the target of training 285,030, of this, 60% i.e. 173,316 were trained by December 2013 with 51% of the approved funds spent on the same. The State has developed training modules for SMCs called Sangama and Samadarshi. In absence of recent independent assessments of what percentage of SMCs meet regularly, function effectively, roles played by them and areas of improvement it is difficult to comment on the quality of SMCs and variation across regions, if any.

Based on review of secondary literature done by the Mission a study of 506 SMCs in four districts of Karnataka indicates that SMCs have played an important role in universalizing elementary education in Karnataka, but SMCs have a long way to go function as active bodies as stipulated under Right to Education in letter and spirit. Some of the findings and issues highlighted by the state are: (i) reach, perceived relevance of training was found to be significantly wanting³; (ii) constitution of SMCs is not being done as per by laws but by Head teachers to suit their interests; (iii) with regard to

² In Karnataka, SMCs are still called as School Development and Monitoring Committees (SDMCs). Mission was told that SDMCs have been reconstituted as per the norms outlined under Right to Education 2009.

³ The study states "It was found from the research that the trainers cook up all sorts of record to create fake attendance and utilization of funds. Majority of them said that the trainings are just for namesake. Usually, they take signatures, provide some food and send them back." (p. 227). These and other observations from the study need to be taken and addressed seriously. While updated, study appears to be conducted in 2009-10 and hence fairly recent.

monitoring teacher and student attendance and monitoring student incentives, 66% SMCs were not taking any action on this front; (iv) majority parents (62%) felt SMCs were not very effective, while majority teachers (56%) felt SMCs had significantly contributed to development of schools. The study points at higher participation levels of teachers in SMC functioning as compared to parents; and (v) 48% SMCs were getting their accounts audited with wide regional variation with only 12% in Gulbarga to 70% in Mangalore. (Centre for Child and Law, NLSU, undated).

The Mission recommends focused efforts to constitute, capacitate and activate SMCs to play active role in meeting SSA goals as part of State's comprehensive planning to provide quality elementary education and regularly assess their functioning.

Goal 4: Education of Satisfactory Quality

Key Observations:

1. The state has taken up various initiatives to promote quality of teaching learning in classrooms, state level testing of student learning levels through Karnataka School Quality Assessment and Accreditation Council (KSQAAC) is being carried out for several years, provision of libraries is near universal, implementation of CCE in all schools and some material provisions of science / math /geography kits in all or some middle schools.
2. Nali-Kali: Starting with a pilot in HD Kote district, the state up-scaled Nali-Kali programme (activity based teaching learning process adapted from Rishi Valley's Multi Grade Multi Level – MGML programme) in all primary schools from 2008-09, Nali Kali was initially implemented for grade 1 and 2 and then extended to grade 3. This programme is implemented in all Kannad and Urdu medium schools, which have been provided with graded learning cards (515 cards for grade 1, 442 for grade 2 and 351 for grade 3 catering to language, mathematics and Environment Science). State is reasonably satisfied with implementation of the programme especially as it promotes learning at child's pace, has in built component of CCE, expected to promote peer learning and creates active, joyful classrooms. One external evaluation of Nali Kali completed in 2010 with largely positive findings.
3. Mission noted that Nali Kali classes looked more active and had greater scope for involvement of the child, teaching learning material was provided in all classrooms visited and use of at least some teaching learning material was visible in all classes. By and large teachers reported that Nali Kali method promoted child centred, active learning in classrooms.

4. However, the mission also noted were number of issues pertaining to implementation of Nali Kali especially (i) teacher do not approve of clubbing grade 3 with grade 1 and 2 under Nali Kali; (ii) over crowding of teaching learning material and inadequate storage space in most classes; (iii) inability of children read the card selected by the child, by number of children in a randomly selected classroom, which may or may not be representative; (iv) classrooms had overwhelming amount of pre-prepared cards / reading material, displays including those on the ceiling, well above the eye level of children, and is likely to make limited contribution to children's learning; (v) inadequate training and on-site support received, as reported by some teachers.
5. Radio Programme: Mission also made note of department run radio programme which teacher. It was reported that children take interest in English lessons. We also noted that reception of radio broadcast was good. Since children of grade 1 to 3 listen to same broadcast in Nali Kali, how design addresses differences in children's learning levels as well as appropriateness of the content was something that needs to be understood and examined.
6. Computer Assisted Learning (CAL): 20% of the Upper Primary Schools in the state have been provided with 5 computers per school as part of CAL. Independent assessment commissioned by SSA shows that around 70% of the computers are functional. Apart from limited reach CAL following points need to be deliberated: (i) 5 computers per school appear to be low in terms of providing access to all children handle computer; (ii) apart from teaching children to use computers, what is the purpose and goals of computer mediated learning? What skills are CAL expected to build in teachers and children? These are some critical aspects that are currently not articulated; (iii) mechanisms for maintenance and repair or computers also appears to be an issue; (iv) limited investment in teachers in building their skills to handle and use computer to enhance learning is also an issue.
7. Teaching of English: collaboration between the State, UNICEF and British Council is training all elementary school teachers in English through cascade mode of training by Master teachers trained at block level. 9-10 days of training in 3 modules of speaking, reading and writing. Teachers we spoke to at a BRC, undergoing the training reported that they had found the training useful and stated need for ongoing support for building adequate competency. Master trainer was confident and articulate and appeared to be diligently following the training plan.
8. Science teaching: SSA is supporting Agastya Foundation to promote activity based science teaching in 4 districts in 40 to 60 schools per district. Considering typical science

education in schools which is largely based on textbooks and teacher talk, this is move in the right direction. Independent evaluation of the programme suggested positive feedback on the programme / kit from children and teachers, though nature of changes that the programme intended and achieved in changing teaching learning of science education in school, how it contributed to better conceptual understanding etc needs to be understood.

9. Learning levels of children: various state and independent studies suggest that learning levels of children in the state is a cause of concern. (i) Grade 8 test outcomes of NAS by NCERT reveals that students from Karnataka are at par with the national average (which is low) in mathematics and social science and below national average for reading comprehension and science; (ii) ASER 2013 suggests decline in learning level of grade 3 and 5 children with only 38% grade 3 children able to read grade 1 text and only 42% of grade 5 children being able to read grade 3 text. Only 28% of grade 3 children could do subtraction and 18% of grade 5 children can do division; (iii) other studies such as study of a small sample of primary school using Nali Kali indicated at least 40% of third graders and about 50% fourth grader and 60% fifth graders reading well below the grade level and higher order skills in literacy as well as free writing require significant attention (Menon, 2012); (iv) the State initiated testing through KSQAAC shows declining learning levels across grade 3 to 9 with average learning achievement across grade 3, 5 and 7 (Additional documents provided by SSA Karnataka to JRM, Jan 2014)
10. Nature and purpose of testing: the Mission is concerned about purpose and use of testing. Studies repeatedly show poor learning achievements in students. How these findings are used to inform classroom practice, nature of trainings given to teachers, kind of academic capacity build in CRC BRC personnel is at present entirely unclear. Assessment of student learning appears to have little connect with processes that impact learning outcomes especially curriculum, teaching learning processes and teacher capacity building. There is limited insight on what practices and parameters account for higher or lower performance among students / schools / blocks and hence testing seems to be of limited use, at present.
11. Co-curricular areas: art education, sports and physical education appeared to be marginal. Some interesting initiatives such as intensive art education module for 600 children in one district visited with SPIC-MACAY were reported, but comprehensive plan for strengthening these co-curricular areas was not apparent.

Recommendations

1. Comprehensive plan for improving quality of teaching-learning: State needs to develop a comprehensive plan to improve quality of teaching learning with focus on enhancing student learning and development. Clear articulation of expected

outcomes needs to guide planning, evaluation, onsite support, teacher training and assessment frameworks. Role and responsibility of teachers, CRPs, BRPs, DIET faculty and district/ State level SSA officials needs to be defined in that light.

- 2. Comprehensive, independent evaluation of Nali Kali: Mission recommends evaluation of Nali Kali implementation and outcomes by a competent academic institution in order to identify issues in the programme design and implementation, if any, and restructuring the programme to strengthen learning among children, if required.*
- 3. Diagnostic testing: student, teacher, school or programme assessments need to inform planning and implementation. Routinised testing is likely to have adverse impact and hence assessment and evaluation need to part of thought through plan of achieving quality.*
- 4. Investing in teachers: teachers need to be equipped with adequate subject knowledge, skills to assess effectiveness of teaching practice or curricular material and ways of providing additional support to children who are not progressing adequately. Space and autonomy for teachers to take considered decisions for their classrooms is equally important. Traditional in-service trainings in past ten years have, at best yielded mixed results. Stronger onsite support, creating pool of Master Teachers in a block with subject specialization, building well-equipped resource centres at DIET /Block Resource Centre, providing range of professional development opportunities to teachers are possible ideas that can be drawn by the state based on initiatives tried in Karnataka, at smaller scale.*
- 5. Develop a clear plan of how CAL can promote higher order skills of searching, analyzing information, problem solving to be developed after examining good ICT interventions.*
- 6. Twining of government schools with Navoday and Kendriya Vidyalaya in the vicinity as well as University departments of Education is strongly suggested. Suitable mechanisms for resource sharing, collaboration, join programming should be encouraged by the State.*

D. Programme Management

Key Observations and Recommendations:

- 1. Vacancies at Cluster / Block level: vacancies at the BRC level range from 11 to 23% for vacancies of BRP (primary and high school) and BRC. CRP vacancies are 12% (out of*

total sanctioned posts of 4,103) are selected through a competitive process and appointment is done for 3 years. The state also has induction manual for CRPs. However, ways in which academic skills and mentoring, classroom observation skills are built in this cadre is not articulated.

2. Role perception of CRP – BRP: Based on interaction of the Mission members CRC and BRC personnel perceive themselves as information transmitters. They were able articulate tasks that they perform but not the central role that they are expected to play. Academic role of CRP and BRPs has been marginalized and this is considerable cause of concern.

Automation and IT support is strongly recommended for CRP – BRPs to reduce the time spent on information gather / dissemination. There is also a strong need to build academic capacity in this cadre which is linked to outcomes expected at the school level. Documents such as the MHRD prepared CRC-BRC Guidelines (2011) can be used by the state to come up with a suitable plan.

3. Disconnect between CRC-BRC and DIETs: funds for training for teacher in the district flows through DIET. However, structurally DIETs continue to disconnected from SSA's programme implementation structure inform of DDPI office – BRC – CRC.

There is significant scope and need for building closer linkage between these institutions.

4. Stability in SSA cadre: It was observed that stability of tenure at senior levels was an area of concern. Out of the 15 SPDs SSA Karnataka has had since 2001 to 2013 only 2 SPDs have been in that position for more than one year. 5 SPDs have held the position for 3 months or less. Such tenures are likely to have adverse impact on institutional memory, leadership and compromise Mission objectives.

It is strongly suggested that persons are deputed to SSA based on interest and merit and effort is made to have stability in the cadre.

5. State SSA Body headed by CM – last met in Jan 2011. No meeting had taken place for 4 years and this is cause of concern.

SSA body needs to meet regularly and necessary steps taken to ensure that governance process is paid due attention by the State and MHRD.

6. Executive Council: EC meets 2 to 4 times a year in the state. However, Karnataka is among the few states in the country where EC for SSA continues to be headed by the Education Secretary, instead of Chief Secretary. Considering that convergence between departments is paramount for SSA's success, current structuring of EC needs to be revisited.

EC needs to be headed by Chief Secretary to ensure participation senior members from concerned departments that can result into better convergence. EC also needs considerable strengthening by adding members from all relevant departments, currently un-represented such as Health, Rural Development, Tribal Welfare, WCD and so on.

7. Action Taken on JRMs: Mission noted a degree of routinisation of SSA programme and processes being followed. Response of the state on some important points flagged in 18th JRM was cursory in some cases without providing proper plan and timeline or dismissive i.e. 'DIETs and CRC – BRCs are in total harmony in the state'.

ATRs need to be more specific and reflective of state's commitment to engage with suggestions and take necessary action.

E. Other Issues

Key observations and Recommendations

1. Convergence between SSA and related programmes / departments: need for close coordination and synergy between various departments that deal with children or factors that impact children's learning and development is necessary to achieve SSA's goals. Especially relevant are following issues: (i) relocation of Anganwadis on or near the primary school; (ii) addressing under nourishment in children; (iii) optimum rehabilitation of CWSN children in coordination with Health and WCD; (iv) timely and appropriate disbursements of scholarships to SC-ST children and maintenance allowance to eligible CWSN to illustrate a few.

Strong coordination mechanisms between departments need to be developed from state to block level.

2. Malnutrition: Mission observed number of underweight, under nourished children during the school visit, despite well functioning Mid Day Meal programme as well as worthy initiative of the state to provide 150 ml milk provided to all children, three times a week. Subsequent review of secondary data on malnutrition for the state based on NFHS III and Sood (2010) among others suggest that Karnataka has highest level of malnutrition among the four Southern states. The prevalence of under nutrition appears to increase from about 63% among children in 6-9 year age group to 78% in 10-13 years and then declined to 66% in 14-17 year age group. Estimated 70 to 80% children have been found to be anemic.

While reducing malnourishment is not a stated goal of SSA, this is necessary pre-condition to achieve SSA goals and SSA needs to work with WCD, Health, Rural Development on address this issue.

3. Funding cuts: Mission was told that following activities and initiatives were adversely impacted due to funding cuts: (i) District specific booklets provided to each UPS student has been stopped from 2013-14; (ii) Inclusive Education Resource Teacher provision stopped. Inclusive education will be adversely impacted with it; (iii) Teacher grant stopped; (iv) CRC level meetings reduced to 2 per year instead of 8; (v) In service teacher training reduced to 5 days at the block level instead of 20 under SSA in earlier year; (vi) Innovative activities such as good initiative by SSA with SPIC-MACAY for art education to be cut back.

It is suggested that the SSA – Karnataka and MHRD jointly evaluate how funds can be optimally utilized and good initiatives continued. Mission also recommends Karnataka to develop tie ups with State and Zonal Cultural bodies for promoting art education in schools and to hold district / block level events as a regular feature.

4. Vacancies in DEd course at DIET: recruitment in DIETs stands at 10% of the total seats in DIETs in 2013-14 (259 filled out of total seats of 2280). Mission observed that enrolment in Dharwad in 2013 was 0 in one district and 18 in the other district that was visited as against capacity of 100. Since all but 4 DIETs in the state have pre-service wings, this trend needs to be analyzed and necessary steps taken.
5. EWS seats in private schools: State has calculated 108,344 EWS seats in private schools in the state. 70% of these seats were filled. 14 districts have more than 30% vacancies under the quota. A number of districts like Belgaum, Bangalore North / South, Mysore, had large vacancies, despite presence of number of private schools. State's explanation of only few private schools being in demand does not seem adequate.

It is suggested that the trend is analyzed based on size of schools, urban –rural distribution, processes followed in high / low vacancy districts and necessary action taken, where required.

6. State Council for Protection for Child Right (SCPCR) had received only 45 complains pertaining to RtE. Based on it appeared that awareness regarding SCPCR needed significant strengthening.

F. Finance:

Key Observations and Recommendations:

1. Requested budget of SSA from MHRD was Rs. 3,12,313.11 lakhs of which Rs.1,18,216.08 lakhs was approved. Of the approved budget, expenditure as on December 2013 was Rs.72,653.77 lakhs which is 73.76% against released funds and 61.46% against allocation. This indicates a healthy trend (SSA – Karnataka JRM presentation, Jan 15, 2014). *However as in some districts, expenditure is below 50% as on November 30, 2013 figures provided and requires some attention.*
2. Response from the state to comments on the audited statement of accounts of 2011-12 are awaited and needs to be resolved on priority.
3. Audit report of 2012-13 has been submitted by the State to MHRD.
4. At the State level,1 Financial Controller,2 Account Superintendents and 8 Accounts Assistants have been sanctioned. 30 districts have been provided with 1 Accounts Superintendent and 1 Accounts Assistant. All 203 Blocks have been provided with one Accounts Assistant through the outsource mode. One Accounts Assistant has been provided for every 50 schools to write the books of Accounts at school level. 4 days training for district level officials and 2 days training for block level assistants have been conducted. The State is following the cash basis of accounts instead of accrual system of accounts. This requires attention and action.
5. The State has prepared the Annual Procurement Plan and has hosted the same on the website. This and e-tendering will go a long way to promote transparency in procurement.
6. Internal Audit is done by empanelled Chartered Accountant firms. Statutory Auditors have submitted their report for 2012-13.The process of appointment of Statutory Auditors for 2013-14 is under process. The Statutory auditors have commented that Advances given under SSA and KGBV are pending. The Register of Advances has not been physically verified. The Accountant General has done the audit upto 2012-13 and audit is up-to-date.
7. Steps need to be taken to take corrective actions based on internal and statutory auditor observations.

G. Conclusion:

Karnataka has made significant progress in achieving SSA goals. Main challenge remains in ensuring quality teaching learning that results in learning and development of all children, especially those from marginalized backgrounds. The State needs to develop a

comprehensive plan to achieve quality at primary and upper primary schools, shift focus from inputs to outputs and take steps to ensure convergence between SSA and related departments.

Reference:

DISE (2012-2013) Elementary Education in India: Progress towards UEE, NUEPA, New Delhi.

Government of Karnataka (2012-13), Education in Karnataka: an Analytical Report, Bangalore.

Menon S. (2012) Findings of pilot phase of Literacy Research in Indian Languages; Azim Premji University, Bangalore.

MHRD (2011) CRC-BRC Guidelines
http://www.teindia.nic.in/Files/Reports/BRC_CRC_Guidelines-Final.pdf

Sood, N. (2010) Malnourishment in children in among children in India: Linkages with cognitive development and school participation, CREATE Pathways to Access. Research Monograph no. 25.

Annexure:

States	No.	State wise Districts	Total	Muslim	Muslim	Urban	Muslims in	Muslim	
			Population	Population	%	Population	Urban Areas	%	
Karnataka	<u>1</u>	Bangalore	6,537,124	874,600	13.4	5,759,987	828,584	14.4	
	<u>2</u>	Gulbarga	3,130,922	551,171	17.6	852,621	286,159	33.6	
	<u>3</u>	Dharwad	1,604,253	315,177	19.6	881,917	226,774	25.7	
	<u>4</u>	Belgaum	4,214,505	440,836	10.5	1,012,691	204,686	20.2	
	<u>5</u>	Mysore	2,641,027	234,302	8.9	982,128	186,584	19.0	
	<u>6</u>	Kolar	2,536,069	298,767	11.8	625,523	177,798	28.4	
	<u>7</u>	Bellary	2,027,140	257,806	12.7	706,850	169,625	24.0	
			Dakshina						
	<u>8</u>	Kannada	1,897,730	418,904	22.1	729,302	162,784	22.3	
	<u>9</u>	Davanagere	1,790,952	226,708	12.7	542,998	139,145	25.6	
	<u>10</u>	Bijapur	1,806,918	294,491	16.3	396,089	127,917	32.3	
	<u>11</u>	Bidar	1,502,373	295,762	19.7	344,875	127,214	36.9	
	<u>12</u>	Raichur	1,669,762	228,652	13.7	420,837	120,423	28.6	
	<u>13</u>	Shimoga	1,642,545	200,979	12.2	571,010	119,852	21.0	
	<u>14</u>	Tumkur	2,584,711	211,732	8.2	507,202	119,424	23.5	
			Bangalore						
	<u>15</u>	Rural	1,881,514	170,570	9.1	407,396	110,878	27.2	
	<u>16</u>	Bagalkot *	1,651,892	184,013	11.1	478,520	104,085	21.8	
	<u>17</u>	Haveri *	1,439,116	253,927	17.6	299,020	101,084	33.8	
			Uttara						
	<u>18</u>	Kannada	1,353,644	161,574	11.9	387,913	90,459	23.3	
	<u>19</u>	Gadag *	971,835	126,232	13.0	342,183	74,092	21.7	
	<u>20</u>	Chitradurga	1,517,896	109,412	7.2	274,238	65,390	23.8	
<u>21</u>	Hassan	1,721,669	104,730	6.1	304,673	64,945	21.3		
<u>22</u>	Koppal	1,196,089	137,174	11.5	198,292	58,531	29.5		
<u>23</u>	Chikmagalur	1,140,905	94,429	8.3	222,724	44,858	20.1		

21 out of the 23 of above have over 20% Muslim population in urban areas

Source: http://www.aicmeu.org/Muslim_Population_Distribution_in_India.htm