

# **APPRAISAL**

## **HARYANA ANNUAL WORK PLANS 1995-96**

**State: Haryana**

**Districts: Jind  
Kaithal  
Sirsa  
Hissar**

NIEPA DC



D09084

**LIBRARY & DOCUMENTATION CENTRE**  
**National Institute of Educational**  
**Planning and Administration.**  
**17-B, Sri Aurobindo Marg,**  
**New Delhi-110016**  
DCC, No ..... D-9084 .....  
Date ..... 11-04-96 .....

**APPRAISAL**  
**HARYANA ANNUAL WORK PLANS 1995-96**

Due to limited coverage of activities in 1994-95, the Haryana AWP for 1995-96, proposes both continuation of the activities of the year 1994-95 and inclusion of a few selected activities of the year 1994-95 and inclusion of a few selected activities for the year 1995-96.

Certain points

- Lack of clarity in terms of presentation (item/cost analysis); The write up has not been provided according to the approved format. There is no illustration in terms of thrust areas for either the state AWP or the district AWP.
- No background information has been provided about the districts.
- 7 year plan projection is absent.
- Difference between the amount shown in budget at glance and item wise analysis.
- The amount of Rs.10 lakhs for consultancy needs specifications.
- The activities categorised under innovation do not seem innovation activities eg. strengthening of school supervision, creche facility (0-3 years).
- Maintenance is provided even before the construction work is on.
- Lack of detailed information about MIS.
- Spill over is not mentioned.
- The cost of orientation programmes is over estimated (Rs.5.67 lakhs: Jind)
- Demand for NFE instructors is over estimated in Hisar (500), while in Jind it is 100 only).

### Beyond DPEP Guidelines

- Proposal of creche facilities for 0-3 years age group.
- Remuneration for extra coaching. (~~State~~ document)
- Proposal of kits (Hisar and Jind)
- Civil construction at BRC.
- Non-educational incentives are not permissible; further information needs to be provided whether the incentives proposed in the AWPS are educational or non educational.
- Honorarium to guest speaker (Hisar)
- Text Book Board.
- Proposal of 6 vehicles (State)
- Material for mobilization of VEC (Rs.12.56 lakhs).

**APPRAISAL**  
**STATE ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1995-96: HARAYANA**

The total expenditure estimated on the State for the year 1995-96 is Rs.3169.52 lakhs.

**A. General**

1. The project estimates for the next six years have not been given.
2. The AWP focusses mainly on primary education.
3. It is focussed on group currently out of school such as drop-outs and non-enrolled children.
4. No 7 year plan projection has been given. With the limited data provided in the AWP, it is not possible to determine expected output.
5. The AWP has proposed schemes such as, Mobile Schools, Remedial coaching in the classroom etc. No further information has been provided about the additionality criteria of the schemes.
6. Time table as well as workload seems realistic.
7. The AWP do not give adequate information about replacement and strengthening of schemes.
8. Plan is not sufficient in giving information about the State.
9. The contingency in the AWP is as follows:

-	contingency for the SIE and SCERT	Rs. 29.70 lakhs,
-	TA/DA	Rs. 07.40 lakhs,
-	office expenses	Rs. 03.50 lakhs,
		-----
-	Total contingency	Rs. 40.60 lakhs.
10. Although the activities proposed in the AWP are within the DPEP Guidelines, but they lack clarity in terms of item and cost wise distribution.

**B. Cost effectiveness**

1. While in some places, items have been costed, in others not. Further details have not been provided regarding costing of items. For example the overall cost of MIS has been given, but details have not been given.

2. Basis of costing is not very clear, as there is discrepancy in the amounts mentioned at various places in the document. For example, there is a discrepancy in the amount of money for contingency presented in the Section AWP At glance (i.e. total contingency = Rs 26.60 lakhs) and the amount of money for contingency presented item wise (i.e. Rs. 40.60 lakhs)
- 3. Recurring cost: Rs.169.50 lakhs.
4. The amount of Rs. 167 lakhs has been proposed as cost for the supplies of textbooks in the district AWP.
5. In the absence of 7 year plan information, it is difficult to verify the DPEP ceiling on Civil and management costs.

### C. Thrust Areas

#### I. Management Issues

1. Staff
  - 5 EMIS. April 95
  - 10 Haryana text book board. April 95.
  - 40 Strengthening SCERT. May 95.
  - 5 Strengthening SCERT
  - 2 ECE Cell. April 95
  - 2 NFE Cell. May 95.
2. Modifications proposed are not clear.
3. 6 Vehicles have been asked for. Only 5 are allowed as per the DPEP guidelines and the EFC meeting recommendations.
4. The consultanncy fee of Rs.10 lakhs seems very high.
5. The evaluation and monitoring activities have not been budgeted. Why so?

#### II. Training (Teachers & NFE)

##### a. Training

1. In the training programmes proposed in the AWP, training strategies and contents of training are not clear.
2. Training will be imparted by SCERT.

3. Chain  
SCERT --> DIET.
4. SCERT will prepare training material.
5. No specifications about training modules.
6. Staff will be recruited to strengthen SCERT.

### III. Pedagogy

Learning material will be prepared by the SCERT.

### IV. Civil Works

1. No information available on the plans and construction of school.

Civil works	-	80 lakhs
Maintenance	-	15 lakhs

The civil works proposed at the State are outside the DPEP guidelines. The civil cost of Rs. 80 lakhs seems very high.

### V. Gender & Tribal

- Workshop & orientation programme for gender sensitization.
- Field testing & refinement of material.
- No enrolment drives
- NFE programme.

### VI. Community participation

- Material for mobilization of VECs = Rs. 12.58 lakhs
- Production of audio-visual for mobilization.
- Training of district & SCERT functionaries.

### VII. MIS

1. No Computer specifications have been given.
2. Recruitment/deputation has been proposed for computer professionals and it will complete by April 1995.
3. Training will be imparted to the new staff by May 1995.
4. Software has been proposed for EMIS.

**APPRAISAL**  
**District Annual Work Plan 1995-96: Sirsa**

**A. General List**

1. Data for whole state are provided; but no projection beyond 1995-96 has been given. Insufficient data for 1995-96 for the concerned district.
- 1.a AWP is focussed on primary education.
2. AWP has taken into consideration groups currently out of school.
3. In the absence of 7 year plan projection, the AWP's link with the overall objectives of the DPEP cannot be established.
4. The activities to be conducted are mentioned. The ways to achieve some of these are clear.
5. It is possible to determine expected outputs and the time.
7. The time-table seems to be realistic.
8. The work load, (except few activities such as training) is realistic.
9. There is no mention of replacing existing central/ state scheme.
10. The AWP does not give adequate information about general background of the district. No specification for the district regarding contextualising factor has been provided.
11. The plan proposes contingency funds office augmentation at the cost Rs. 10.98 lakhs whereas that calculated from activity first stands at 7.14 lakhs.

**B. Cost Effectiveness**

1. Inputs are costed.
2. Unit cost along with no required given.
  - a. Training (no specifications about training modules)
  - b. Equipment (specifications not given)
3. Recurring cost = Rs.151.79 lakhs/Rs.526.19 lakhs (Total).



4. No specific information provided (may be due to lack of a write-up). Still mentioned in the AWP is

Formal: Construction of = 21  
New schools buildings  
Non-formal: 350 NFE - Instructors meaning  
thereby 350 NFE - centres?

- 5. Text-Book supply cost = Rs.13.70 lakhs} For formal Primary  
Education  
Work-Book = Rs.15.00 lakhs}

Similarly for NFE Education.

6. Civil construction cost = Rs.218.97 lakhs/ 526.19  
lakhs for 1995-96 = 41.6 of total budget for  
1995-96

8. In the absence of 7 years plan project, the ceiling on management cost cannot be computed.

### C. Thrust Area

#### I. Management Issues

1. Recruitment of staff = 5 as against 13 no.  
proposed during 1994-95.
2. Modifications not clear from proposals.
3. Vehicles : Consistent with recruitment and  
responsibilities.
4. Supervision through VEC and Cluster and Block-level has  
been envisaged.
5. The activities do not rely heavily on the use of  
consultants.
6. Evaluation activities have not been proposed.

#### II. Training - Teachers of NFE Instructors

1. Teachers/NFE instructors of new teacher proposed for NFE  
new teachers proposed for formal primary education not  
clear.
2. There is no indication of state government filling  
vacancies.

3. Teacher demand projection has been made for state as a whole.
4. NFE teacher are support to be there by October '95.
5. Salaries of additional teachers at CRC and NFE - Instructors Specified.

### **Training**

1. The training chain is SCERT-->DIET-->BRC-->Individuals-->CRC.
2. No number of trainees clear.
3. Training modules to be prepared.
4. Specification of training materials not specified.
5. Only summary training at CRC level is clear.
6. No specifications provided.
7. Sequencing is correct SCERT, DIET and BRC's seems to be adequately staffed and.
8. Staffing, training and augmenting of DIET is proposed.
9. CRC's will hold monthly training.

### **III. Pedagogy**

1. Text Books: Number of distribution is given; no link to enrollment is established. SCERT will look after the job of production of Text-Books, Work-Books and Teacher guides.

### **IV. Civil Works**

1. Only the number of schools, and new school buildings have been given.
2. Maintenance has been provided.

### **V. Gender and Tribal**

#### **Gender**

1. The "enrolment drives" include posters, puppet shows, use of VCRs etc.
2. About practices/ new materials nothing is clear.
3. The training VEC members at BRCs and CRCs has been proposed.
4. Toilet construction is proposed.
5. Female recruitment is not indicated.

## **Tribals**

1. Opening of NFE - centres proposed.
  2. Review of material is not indicated.
  3. Recruitment of NFE-Instructors is proposed to be complete by October '95.
- Important : A mobile teaching experiment is proposed to be initiated on a pilot-scale.

## **VI. Community Participation**

1. Methods for disbursing funds have not been indicated.
2. Posters, wall writings, are some of the measures taken for mobilization/ environment building.
3. Active participation of VEC is proposed.

## **VII. MIS**

1. Two computers have been proposed for procurement.
2. MIS-staff have been identified and their recruitment proposed.
3. Information regarding Data Collection Format has not been given.

## **Comments**

1. The absence of 7 year plan projection.
2. The absence of status report of education in the district.
3. The absence of a complete write-up makes it difficult to analyse the AWP.

**APPRAISAL**  
**District Annual Work Plan 1995-96: Kaithal**

Haryana Annual work plans 1995-96, due to limited coverage of activities in 1994-95, proposes both continuation of the activities of the year 1994-95 and inclusion of a few selected activities of the 1995-96. Kaithal has estimated expenditure for the year 1995-96 is Rs. 580 lakhs.

**A. General List**

1. They have provided data only for 1995-96.
2. It is focussed on primary education.
3. Yes it has focussed on the drop outs.
4. Projection about 7 years plan dose not exit.
5. They have mentioned about certain remedial coaching, mobile teaching in general for the whole state, but not for the specific districts.
6. Since, no detailed information is available about the each district one cannot say that activities much with the project objectives, or not.
7. Time table is realistic and can be achieved.
8. There is no mention of contextual and background of the state.
9. The AWP has not proposed replace existing central/state schemes but strengthen the Governmental organisation such as?
10. Contingency fund has been proposed for TA/DA, periodicals and other experts in general = 2.54 lakhs.
11. Proposals are within DPEP guidelines in general but no specific information can be given as budget does not have detailed information.

**B. Cost Effectiveness**

1. There is not detailed information about the cost of all inputs eg. staffing scholarships even contingency.
2. Recurring cost - Rs.157.22 lakhs for 1995-96.
3. No information about the number of schools opened.

4. No information about the money spent on the supply of text books etc.
5. No conclusion can be drawn about whether the Budget exceeds the ceiling of 24% (Civil works) + 6% (maps).

### **C. Thrust Areas**

#### **I. Management Issues**

1. No clear information on the staffing pattern. (in terms of numbers).
2. No information about the manpower forecasting, intake of people and kind of training proposed.
3. One cannot decide in the AWP. Whether that the demand of vehicle and equipments is justified with the responsibilities and number of people vehicle - 3 - 6 lakhs.
4. Supervision by district and block level officials (BRC & CRC).
5. They don't only on the use of consultants.
6. There is no evaluation plan.
7. There is a demand made for CTV and VCR at BRC level which outside the DPEP guidelines.

#### **II. Training: Teachers + NFE Instructors**

1. Teachers are proposed only for NFE i.e. 100. Salary for additional teachers is 19.32 lakhs.
2. No forecast about the need/demand has been made about the teachers.
3. Lack of information about the vacancies filled by the Government.
4. Salaries of NFE teachers have been budgeted 2.40 lakhs for 100 people but not other teachers.

#### **Training**

1. No mention about the strategy and number of trainers, for the training programmes.

2. Training will be imparted by DIET officers and manuals will be prepared by SCERT.

3. Training Chain

SCERT--->DIET----->BRC----->CRC----->VEC

4. No specifications about the centre of training qualification of trainers and trainees. Information is available about the DIET staffing.

5. No information about the kind of materials.

6. No mention about the follow up of training.

### III. Pedagogy

No information about the distribution but information is available about preparation by SCERT.

### IV. Civil Works

1. No information about the planning and construction of schools. The estimated cost for 1995-96 is 250.30 lakhs.

2. There is no mention about the maintenance of building.

### V. Gender and Tribal

1. For Gender and tribal groups, puppet shows/ street plays, poster, pamphlets and other awareness campaigns have been organised.

2. Training and orientation programme at VEC level is given for sensitise.

3. No mention about the Toilet construction and recruitment of female staff.

4. No specific information available on the alternative form at school for tribals.

### VI. Community Participation

1. Although there is mention of orientation of VEC, no information is available in the fund distribution mobilisation and channel of interaction.

## VII. MIS

There is no information on the Computer specification, procurement, staff, bilingual document but an estimated cost for the purchase and maintenance of computers is given for this year (2.54 lakhs)

-In the absence of 7 years plan document and contextuality it is difficult to do comparative analysis. Thus, detailed information about the opening of schools, equipments, staff pattern, specific programme should be given.

**Appraisal**  
**District Annual Work Plan 1995-96 : Jind, Haryana**

**A. General List**

1. Status data for the state provided but not beyond 1995-96.
- 1.a AWP is focussed on primary education.
2. AWP is focussed on groups currently out of school.
3. In the absence of 7 year project plan no link can be established.
4. Certain activities to be conducted are mentioned and the way to achieve these is clear.
5. The activities are related to project and time.
6. It is possible to determine the out put and the time.
7. The time table is realistic.
8. The work-load (except possibly for training part) is realistic.
9. No mention of replacing existing central /state schemes.
10. The AWP does not give adequate information about general back ground of the district, but the state as a whole-Yes.
11. The AWP proposes contingency funds; total contingency = Rs.4.94 lakhs, office contingency = 7.30 lakhs.

**B. Cost Effectiveness**

1. Inputs are costed sometimes without giving adequate information.
2. Basic of costing is some times clear, some time not clear e.g. equipment under formal primary education costs 111.20 lakhs.
3. Recurring cost = Rs.157.40 lakhs/ Rs.570.78 lakhs.



4. No specific information except for
 

Formal:	Additional class room = 14
	New school buildings = 20
Non Formal:	100 units are costed
5. Free Text books costed = (Rs.14.40 lakhs)
6. Construction cost = 36.7% of proposed budget for 1995-96.
7. In the absence of 7 year plan 6% limit verification is not possible.

**C. Thrust Areas**

**I. Management Issues**

1. Staff in place not clear.
2. Recruitment of staff proposed.
3. Purchase of vehicles - (Equipment - for want of specifications)
4. Supervision by district and block and CRC officials level.
5. Reliance on consultants.
6. Evaluation plan is not clear.

**II. Training - Teachers for NFE Instructors**

**a. Teachers/NFE Instructors**

1. New teachers proposed for NFE new teacher not proposed for formal primary education.
2. It is not clear whether the state Government has filled the posts.
3. No projection about teachers has been made.
4. It is not specific when the teachers will be in place.
5. Salaries of additional teacher at CRC and NFE - Instructors Specified.

**b. Training**

1. The training chain is SCERT-->DIET-->BRC-->VEC-->CRC.
2. No member of trainee is given.
3. Training modules shall be prepared by SCERT for which no time-limit is given.
4. Specialization of materials not specified.
5. About summary training, no specified information except at CRC-level is available.
6. No specification provided.
7. Staffing for DIET and proposed seems adequate.
8. Staffing training and augmenting for DIET is proposed.
9. CRC will file monthly training.

**III. Pedagogy**

**1. Text Books**

Distribution no's is given in link to enrolment established.

Production/ preparation of MLL based textbooks, workbooks and teacher guides have been assigned in SCERT.

**IV. Civil Works**

1. Only the no. of requires of school building, additional classrooms and new school buildings is given.
2. Maintenance has been provided.

**V. Gender and Tribal**

1. The "enrolment drives" include posters, puppet shows use of VEC's and propaganda on media.
2. About practices/ new materials nothing is clear.
3. Training to VEC is proposed.

4. Toilet construction is proposed.
5. Female recruitment is not shown any where.

**b. Tribal**

1. Opening of NFE centre is proposed.
2. Review of materials is not indicated.
3. Recruitment of NFE instructors and providing facilities to keen is proposed.

**VI. Community Participation**

1. Methods of disbursing funds is not indicated any where.
2. Puppet shows, posters, wall-writings are some of the programmes for mobilization/ environment building.
3. Active participants of VEC is proposed.

**VII. MIS**

1. Neither computer - specifications nor hard-ware costing specified.
2. The MIS staff has been identified and proposed for recruitment.
3. Data collection format not specified.

**Comments :** The absence of (1) 7 year plan projection, (2) specification of equipments and (3) status report of education in the district, the analysis is not possible.

**Note :** Haryana AWP for 1995-96 due to the limited coverage of activities in 1994-95, propose both combination of the activities of the year 1994-95 and conclusion of a few selected activities of the year 1994-95 and inclusion of a few selected activities of the 1995-96

APPRAISAL  
DISTRICT ANNUAL WORK PLAN 1995-96: HISSAR (Haryana)

Haryana Annual Work Plans 1995-96, due to limited coverage of activities in 1994-95, proposes a combination of the activities of the year 1994-95 and inclusion of a few selected activities of the 1995-96. Hissar has an estimated expenditure of 1041.28 lakhs for the year 1995-96.

**A. General list**

1. Data have been provided only for the year 1995-96.
  2. The AWP is focussed on Primary education.
  3. Certain activities have been proposed for school dropouts.
  4. The 7 year plan projection has not been given.
  5. It has been mentioned that various activities will be held in the field of mobilization such as Creche, Mobile Schools, Remedial teaching etc.
- The AWP does not mention how these activities are to be achieved.
6. Time plan envisaged for the district AWP seems realistic example.?
  7. Workload is also realistic.
  8. The AWP only proposes to strengthen existing central and State schemes.
  9. There is a mention of background and contextuality of the State in general. No contextual information given for the districts. Separate write-up is needed for the districts.
  10. They propose contingency fund, but there is a discrepancy between the proposed in the budget proposal and in actual.
  11. Proposals are within DPEP guidelines.

*Sanjay Kumar* Project ~~100~~ 4 lakhs - 1 student  
*work book for handbook*  
*improving writing*

## B. Cost effectiveness

1. All the components have been costed eg. mobilization, training.
2. Basis of costing is clear. But information of fellowships and numbers of teachers to be appointed <sup>have</sup> not been provided.
3. Recurring cost is 214.33 lakhs.
4. 11 new schools will be built.
5. Free text books have been proposed to be given to SC & ST girls, amounting to Rs.34.26 lakhs <sup>to girls</sup> ~~transformation~~ information is required about the state provision of free textbooks.
6. No comments can be made about the budget estimation for the construction and Management in the absence information of total budget about outlay (for 7 years).

## C. Thrust Areas

### I. Management Issues

1. Appointments are made to strengthen the organisation.
2. No information is available on how appointments are made.
3. Three vehicles have been purchased with Rs.12 lakhs.
4. Supervision is done by BRC + CRC + District Officials.
5. They do not rely (?) on the use of consultants and their havn't asked for them. Consultancy activity has not been budgeted.
6. Evaluation plan and monitoring at the district has not been budgeted.

### II. Training: Teachers & NFE Instructors.

- 110 new teachers will be added amounting to the cost of Rs.55 lakhs,  
2 ECCE instructors Rs.1.44 lakhs <sup>As sample</sup>  
500 NFE Staff Rs.30 lakhs <sup>let drop</sup>
- MTI scheme on GOI scheme pattern<sup>20</sup>

— workshop and seminar need to be detailed

— PCC & DDEI level 2 Rs.20,000

2. There is no information whether the State Government has filled vacancies.
3. Teacher demand projections have been made but it is not clear when are they going to join.

**b. Training**

1. Training cost has been given w.r.t. the no. of people but training strategies have not been specified.
2. Training will be imparted by DIET offices and manuals will be prepared by SCERT.
3. Training chain  
SCERT --> DIET --> BRC --> CRC --> VEC
4. No information on content and kind of training.
5. No mention about the follow up of training.

**III. Pedagogy**

1. No information is available regarding the relationship between enrolment but the distribution will be over by July' 95 (3479 target).
2. Preparation of training manual will be done by SCERT.

**IV. Civil Work**

1. No information is available on the planning and construction of school. The estimated expenditure for the year 1995-96 is Rs.442.11 lakhs.
2. There is no mention of any expenditure done on the maintenance of building.

**V. Gender & Tribal**

- For Gender & Tribal groups puppet shows, street plays, posters, pamphlets and other awareness campaigns have been organised.
- Training and orientation at VEC level for sensitization.
- 607 toilets have been constructed in 338 schools.
- No specific information is available on the alternative form of school for tribals.

VI. Community Participation

- Although orientation, of VEC, members have been proposed information is not available on the fund, distribution and channel of distribution.

-VII. MIS

Although an estimated expenditure has been given on the maintenance and purchase of computers for this year, there is no specification given regarding procurement, staffing, bilingual document.

In the AWP of Hissar, projection for longer period is needed in terms of cost and physical unit both. More informations are required on kind of activities performed during the current year. Status Report and Time plan will be of help in better evaluation.

*Data Capture format*  
S ~~100~~ = 8  
- 5 allowed  
Data Entry Operators = 180

LIBRARY & DOCUMENTATION CENT.  
National Institute of Educational  
Planning and Administration.  
17-B, Sri Aurobindo Marg,  
New Delhi-110016  
D-9084  
11-04-96

