

# Performance of Major Social Sector Schemes: A Sample Survey Report

By Dr. H. A. C. Prasad Dr. N. K. Sinha Riyaz A. Khan

November 2013

Department of Economic Affairs Ministry of Finance Government of India

# **CONTENTS**

|   | Page  | e No. |
|---|-------|-------|
|   |       |       |
| I. Executive Summary  |       | 3     |
| II. Introduction  |       | 6     |
| III. Performance of selected major Social Sector Programmes of India  |       | 8     |
| a) Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNF       | REGA) | 8     |
| b) National Rural Livelihood Mission "Ajeevika" (NRLM)                |       | 13    |
| c) National Rural Health Mission (NRHM)                               |       | 16    |
| d) Sarva Siksha Abhiyan (SSA)   |       | 20    |
| e) Mid-Day Meal (MDM) Scheme  |       | 23    |
| f) Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA)  |       | 25    |
| g) Related Social Sector Programme – National Horticulture Mission (N | HM)   | 29    |
| IV. Conclusion  |       | 32    |

# **Disclaimer and Acknowledgments**

The views expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Ministry of Finance or Government of India.

The authors would like to thank the Dr. Arvind Mayaram, Secretary, Department of Economic Affairs and Dr. Raghuram G. Rajan former Chief Economic Adviser, Ministry of Finance (presently Governor, RBI) for their encouragement. The authors would also like to thank the concerned state governments and officers at the district and panchayat levels in the different places visited by the team for coordinating the meetings with the different stake holders. The authors would also like to thank the different experts and the beneficiaries who interacted with them in India and provided useful inputs. However, errors, if any, are the responsibility of the authors.

# Performance of Major Social Sector Schemes: A Sample Survey Report

By
Dr. H. A. C. Prasad
Dr. N. K. Sinha
and
Riyaz A. Khan

# I. Executive Summary

The Government of India has been implementing many social sector programmes like Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Gurantee Act (MGNREGA), National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM)/ Swarnajanyanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY), National Rural Health Mission (NRHM), Sarva Siksha Abhiyan (SSA), Mid-Day Meal (MDM) Scheme, Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA) etc. to address the twin issues of unemployment and poverty. The impact of programmes like MGNREGA which provide employment in persondays is reflected in the perceptible fall in unemployment under Current Daily Status (CDS) since the inception of the MGNREGA programme. Similarly impact of poverty alleviation programmes is reflected in the fall in poverty ratios since 2004-05.

In this paper based on both desk research and selected sample survey of some districts in two states in India, an attempt has been made to see the efficacy and performance of the various central government social sector programmes. The main findings of this study are as follows:

Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA): Some activities like check dams in Mysore district, recharging of borewell in Pune district, road laying in Aurangabad district were working well. Even the panchayats had women chairpersons. While husbands of women chairpersons were doing the work, in some other places, the women chairpersons were learning their responsibilities, reflecting the low but growing level of awareness and empowerment of women. In almost all places, wage payments through banks were faster than through Post Offices because of the procedural delays. If the payment of wages is made through banks, the situation is likely to improve further. Thus MGNREGA has helped in increasing the bargaining power of the wage seekers, improving the economic outcomes especially in watershed activities, reducing the distress rural-urban migration, increasing significantly the monthly per capita consumption expenditure of the rural households, reducing the traditional gender wage discrimination, raising their social status and share in decision making at home and empowering women both socially and economically.

Some weaknesses were also found in different places. Though the MGNREGA Act is Panchayat centric and demand based, on the ground, there is lack of principal role in planning by the Gram Sabha/Gram Panchayat. At all the sample sites, the role of the Gram Sabha in planning was more of a formal nature and the programme is being implemented in a supply driven mode and there is lack of panchayat driven selection of work. Under MGNREGA, the need for community projects is becoming less important as probably such works have already been completed or on the brink of saturation or due to lack of common interest in these areas and instead individual activities in farms are preferred. In some places for individual activities under MGNREGA, the difference of market and MGNREGA wages are paid by beneficiaries. In some places only females are interested in MGNREGA works as market wages for males are much higher resulting in only small works being undertaken instead of big projects. There are also cases of procedures being not fully followed, lack of proper planning and some ill-conceived projects. There were also many instances of single beneficiaries and Gram Pamchayats starting activities only to use the MGNREGA funds. Seasonal aspect in provision of employment was also ignored and there were also delays in wage payment up to two months in some districts.

Thus while generally MGNREGA has been able to serve its purpose, better management and further modifications are needed to make the programme more fruitful and even development oriented. In some places there is also scope to use this programme for development of tourism as other community related farm activities have been completed by now. This could help in having many beneficiaries and even nation building instead of single or few beneficiaries.

National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM): The SGSY/NRLM has been working well in many places as in the case of the Pottery work in Alur gram panchayat of Kundapura taluk, Udupi district where one of the beneficiaries was earning even ₹ 1 lakh per month and the Vandana Mahila SHG at Shyanboganahalli in Mysore district making Agarbathis. However in both the cases, better marketing facilities and knowledge of markets were needed. Generally, beneficiaries in activities like tailoring, beauty parlours, chappal making were benefitting, while those in activities like cow rearing were finding marketing problems. The success of any self-employment/employment in service sector depends on careful assessment of demand and supply of the end product through meticulous planning and putting in place the backward and forward linkage. Whenever and wherever, these aspects have been taken care of, it has delivered positive results. One such example is the PACE Hospitality Training Centre at Aurangabad for skilling people to provide them employment in hospitality sector. However even here, there is a need to broaden and

diversify the activities given the amount of investment made in infrastructure like building and equipment.

National Rural Health Mission (NRHM): With the advent of NRHM, India has made remarkable achievements in providing affordable healthcare facilities to the rural poor. Institutional mechanism has also taken shape and there has been considerable growth of health care infrastructure. While the public health centers were performing well in most places, each PHC had its own peculiarities both in terms of performance and problems. Some had good infrastructure, but were working much below their potential, either due to locational problems or availability of doctors or lack of residential facility/ transport for doctors and other staff.

Sarva Siksha Abhiyan (SSA): SSA is performing well in many places with good stock of books and learning material, good examination results, use of Stree Shakti- a local women empowerment groups for cooking mid-day meals and even introduction of elearning. However there were also places where the situation was not as good as in other places. Though the stipulation of RTE Act to have school within 1 km of radius of every habitat to ensure every child gets the opportunity of having a school within his habitation, has made positive dent in availability of schools, use of the criteria of having number of class rooms and teachers in these schools based on the number of students have also compromised on quality aspects which could be noticed in Bopgaon and Savkarmale villages in Pune. These schools set up under the stipulation of 1 km radius did not have the required number of students to have separate rooms for each class. Four classes were operational with only two teachers in two classrooms. Schools in nearby localities were also suffering from the same problem. A single school instead of many schools nearby could have served the purpose better with optimization of resources to augment better infrastructural facilities. The stipulation of having schools within 1 km radius of every habitat needs to be reconsidered to avoid mushrooming of schools nearby without adequate infrastructure and teachers.

Mid-Day Meal (MDM) Scheme: The MDM scheme was working well in the selected schools visited, with some schools even using donations to supplement this effort and serve better food. While some schools had good storage facilities like tin boxes, some schools used gunny bags and did not have proper doors for the store rooms. However greater involvement of teaching staff for this activity was at the cost of their primary activity of teaching. So teaching staff should be involved only in the supervision of serving of meals to students. Delivery of foodgrains to the schools should be the responsibility of the PDS dealers under the supervision of panchayats to ensure good quality and adequate quantity.

Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC)/Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA): Initially, the supply driven approach was adopted for providing sanitation facilities to the rural population. But the experiences in the some states suggested for implementation of the programme in demand driven mode for which emphasis on information, education and communication (IEC) was given for demand generation of sanitation facilities under TSC now renamed as NBA. This has led to enormous increase in sanitation facilities with social cohesion and harmony in rural areas. For example, the model village Yashwantpur Gram at Bahirgaon, Malepur in Aurangabad district is declared free from all social tension and has 100 per cent sanitation facilities. The village leader was a lady, capable of overseeing all the development activities herself. This is also a good example of women empowerment. The convergence activities under NBA and MGNREGA were also visible as per guidelines laid down under the programmes in Hulimanu village in Mysore district.

However, rural sanitation being a state subject, many states have not accorded high priority to the programme resulting in its slow progress. Besides, less emphasis is being given on capacity building and IEC activities at the field level affecting the demand driven approach adversely.

Related Social Sector Programme- National Horticulture Mission: The wholesale APMC fruit and flower market situated in the outskirts of Mysore, constructed under NHM is neat and clean. But it faces limitations/problems like absence of cold storage facilities, lack of resting places for farmers, prevalence of commission agents, etc. The Banana growers cluster under Comprehensive Horticulture Development scheme in Nanjangud taluk in Mysore district was successful in tissue culture cultivation with farmers earning good income. However, the issue of non-inclusion of Banana cultivation for crop insurance unlike other horticulture crops needs to be addressed.

The different social sector programmes show varied performances in different places. While some changes in programmes are needed, implementation and delivery related issues need greater attention. In some cases, greater awareness creation is needed. This could also be done by using special vans with tailor made short movies as in Mysore district to create greater awareness of social sector programmes. These along with strengthening and empowering the basic institutions like Gram Panchayats and Gram Sabhas are needed for promoting greater inclusiveness.

#### II. Introduction

Many programmes/schemes in the area of social sector have been implemented by the Government to improve the well-being and standard of living of the rural poor by targeting explicitly or implicitly unemployment and poverty. The fall in unemployment under current daily status (CDS) which measures the employment and

unemployment in persondays is also a reflection of the impact of progammes like MGNREGA which also provide employment in persondays. Unemployment data under CDS measure shows that at the beginning of the MGNREGA in 2005, unemployment was 34.3 million persondays (in 2004-05) and gradually declined since then to 28.0 million persondays in 2009-10 and further to 24.7 million persondays in 2011-12 (See Table 1). Poverty in India has also declined (as per Planning Commission estimates using the Tendulkar methodology) with the poverty ratio in the country coming down from 37.2 per cent in 2004-05 to 21.9 per cent in 2011-12 (See Table 2). Along with the growth of the economy, the efforts of the Government through various social sector programmes such as MGNREGA, NRLM NRHM etc particularly in rural areas have helped in poverty alleviation and reduction in unemployment.

Table 1

| Description                   | 2008-09 | 2009-10 | 2010-11 | 2011-12 |
|-------------------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| MGNREGA employment (in crore) | 4.5     | 5.3     | 5.5     | 5.0     |
| Item                          | 2004-05 | 2009-10 |         | 2011-11 |
| CDS Unemployment (in million) | 34.3    | 28.0    |         | 24.7    |

Source: MGNREGA Sameeksha 2012 and NSSO

Table 2

| Year    | Poverty Ratios (in %) |       |           |
|---------|-----------------------|-------|-----------|
| i ear   | Rural                 | Urban | All India |
| 1993-94 | 50.1                  | 31.8  | 45.3      |
| 2004-05 | 41.8                  | 25.7  | 37.2      |
| 2011-12 | 25.7                  | 13.7  | 21.9      |

Source: Planning Commission

The Government of India has many social sector programmes like Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Gurantee Act (MGNREGA), National Rural Livelihood Mission (NRLM)/ Swarnajanyanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY), National Rural Health Mission (NRHM), Sarva Siksha Abhiyan (SSA), Mid-Day Meal (MDM) Scheme, Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA) etc. In order to see the efficacy, performance and implementation at the ground level of various social sector programmes/schemes implemented by the Government, to identify the bottlenecks as well as examine the possibilities of replication of good practices, this study was undertaken. Besides desk research, a team of the Department conducted a sample survey of two districts of Karnataka i.e. Udupi and Mysore and two districts of Maharashtra i.e. Aurangabad and Pune. The findings of the study are given in the following section.

# III. Performance of selected major Social Sector programmes of India

#### a) Mahatma Gandhi NREGA:

Mahatma Gandhi NREGA, a flagship employment generation programme of the Government has been instrumental in creating employment opportunities and placing additional income in the hands of the poor and the disadvantaged sections of society who volunteer to do unskilled work with an entitlement of 100 days of wage employment to each registered rural household every financial year. MGNREGA is the first ever law, internationally, that guarantees wage employment at an unprecedented scale. Unique features of the Act include; time bound employment guarantee and wage payment within 15 days; unemployment allowance will be paid by the state government (as per the Act) in case employment is not provided within 15 days; and emphasis on labour intensive works prohibiting the use of contractors, and machinery. The Act also mandates 1/3 per cent participation for women. The primary objective of the Act is to meet the demand for wage employment in rural areas. The works permitted under the Act address causes of chronic poverty like drought, deforestation and soil erosion, so that employment generation is sustainable. The vision and mission of this act is sustainable and inclusive growth of rural India for eradication of poverty by increasing livelihood opportunities, providing social safety net and developing infrastructure for growth. This is expected to improve quality of life in rural India and to correct the developmental imbalances, aiming in the process, to reach out to the most disadvantaged sections of the society. At the national level, with the average wage paid under the MGNREGA increasing from ₹ 65 in FY 2006-07 to ₹ 115 in FY 2011-12, the bargaining power of agricultural labour has increased. Improved economic outcomes, especially in watershed activities, and reduction in distress migration are its other achievements.

During 2013-14, a total of 2.90 crore households have been provided employment with the share of SCs, STs and Women at 23 per cent, 15 per cent and 56 per cent respectively up to September, 2013. The persondays employment for women is well above the stipulation of 1/3 as per the Act. A provision of ₹ 33,000 crore equal to the previous year's budgetary provision has been kept for 2013-14. The expenditure incurred by the States/UTs is ₹ 15,018.99 crore which accounts for 50 per cent of available funds up to September, 2013.

Research studies<sup>1</sup> on MGNREGA have pointed out many positive effects of the scheme. These are as follows:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> MGNREGA Sameeksha 2012, An Anthology of Research Studies on the MGNREGA, 2005 (2006-2012), by Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India.

- MGNREGA has led to a significant increase in monthly per capita consumption expenditure of rural households. It is succeeding as a self-targeting programme with high participation from marginalized groups including the SCs and STs. In the case of both SCs and STs, the participation rate exceeded their share in total population. It has reduced the traditional gender wage discrimination, particularly, in the public works and has had a positive impact on the socio-economic status of women. MGNREGA with its inter-sectoral approach opens an opportunity for convergence with different programmes optimizing public investment.
- MGNREGA works have been described as "Green" and "Decent" i.e. the scheme creates decent working conditions by ensuring workers' rights and legal entitlements, providing social protection and employment and environmentally sustainable works that re-generate the eco-system and protect bio-diversity. Where planned and implemented well, MGNREGA works have led to a rise in ground water, improvement in soil quality and reduction in vulnerability of production system to climate variability. However, some studies have pointed out that the extent and kind of impact of MGNREGA works on the environment depend on the scale of the activities undertaken, the technical design, the quality of assets created and ownership and use of physical structures constructed.
- MGNREGA has had a more direct and positive impact on reducing distress migration as compared to migration taken-up for economic growth and other reasons. It is also important as a supplementary source of income and is being used by rural households for starting their own ventures.
- However, there are some major governance and institutional factors which limit the scope of MGNREGA in breaking the vicious circle in poor states. This is due to these states having higher demand for work but lesser capacity to implement MGNREGA effectively because of institutional factors and end up with greater unmet demand for work. Studies also reveal less awareness levels among the potential beneficiaries regarding the provision of the Act, such as demanding work, unemployment allowance, grievance redressal mechanism including social audit, etc. Planning and prioritisation of the works is to be made by the Gram Sabhas (GS) which should ensure that the development needs are addressed through active participation of the villagers. But GSs are held infrequently, showing low participation at GSs for selection and prioritisation of works and in some of the states like Himachal Pradesh, Jharkhand, Odisha, Tamil Nadu, Uttar Pradesh, less than 50 per cent of the total works in terms of costs were executed by GPs which is against the mandate of the law.<sup>2</sup> Wages and payments are often less than the notified wage and there are delays in payment due to inadequate staff and other institutional factors. Inadequate staff, irregular flow of funds coupled with

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> MGNREGA Sameeksha 2012, An Anthology of Research Studies on the MGNREGA, 2005 (2006-2012), pp56 by Ministry of Rural Development, Government of India.

the problems of poor coverage/network of banks/ post offices and illiterate workers are also responsible for delay in payment as mentioned in different studies.

# **Results of Sample Survey**

The sample survey findings related to MGNREGA are as follows:

- The need for community projects is becoming less important as probably such works have already been completed or on the brink of saturation or due to lack of common interest in these areas and instead individual activities in farms are preferred. In some places, for individual activities under the MGNREGA, the differences of market and MGNREGA wages to the workers are paid by the beneficiaries out of their pockets as in Udupi. In some places like Udupi, the market wage particularly for males is higher than MGNREGA wages. So only females are interested in MGNREGA work. Thus big projects are not undertaken and only small works like canal desilting are done. Therefore, there is a need to see whether MGNREGA in its present structure is needed in all areas and to make region specific modifications in the programme accordingly.
- The procedures are not fully followed in some places as in the case of the desilting of pond at Alur GP where there was no measurement pillar or any other mechanism which could facilitate smooth measurement of the quantum of work done. In some cases, the three photographs prior, middle and post operation were not taken from the same angle which could establish that they were of the same work-site. Not many had the knowledge of preparation of Labour Budget as per the guidelines at the G.P. level or block or district level. While the Panchayat Officers are knowledgeable and intelligent, there is a need for training programmes for the officials and non-officials involved in the implementation of the programme.
- In some cases proper planning was absent as in the case of desilting work of tank in Badanavalu, Mysore district where the work was not completed mainly as the feeding canal needs to be cleared (which was not in the planned project) and side walls of the tank were not properly constructed. The fish pond at Thattekere, Mysore district is another example of wrong planning. The huge pond has no side walls and no fish! Though the single beneficiary belonged to the Scheduled Caste, he had 3-4 acres of land in which tobacco and other crops were cultivated. If proper labour budget planning were to be made by the Panchayat as per MGNREGA norms, this would not have been a priority, though technically the

farmer is eligible. There is a need to relook at the individual beneficiary provisions of the MGNREGA.

- Check dams work was good in many places. For example in Konanuru, Mysore district check dam was constructed under MGNREGA with a cost of ₹ 3 lakh. During rainy season, water will be stored in the check dam and can be used for irrigation of nearby agricultural lands.
- There are also cases of totally ill- conceived projects as in the case of the work of internal road at Village Mamnapur, G.P. Bhadji, Aurangabad district. The length of the road was 1.5 km. with a proposed cost of Rs. 19 lakh. The proposed activity was ill-conceived and did not seem to be beneficial to the community. It was also found that there was only earth-filling and no side drainage was conceived either at planning or at execution level. Moreover, machines were used to do the work instead of employing people. It seemed that the work was planned only to utilize funds. No records were shown relating to this work. Delay in payment of wages ranged from one month to three months.
- In some cases middlemen were included in MGNREGA works as in the case of desilting tank in Aurangabad where tractor used to remove silt was provided free of cost by some people, but the silt was sold by them in the same vicinity for profit. This money could at least have been used to provide on-site facilities to the workers or could have been used as revenue to the government.
- In many panchayats, while women chairpersons were there, their work was effectively done by their husbands which is against the Act, though in some cases women were learning slowly. This reflects the low but growing level of awareness and empowerment.
- There are also activities which were planned well as in the case of laying of road of a length of 2 kms at Palod & Anad, Block Sillod in Aurangabad with an estimated cost of Rs. 14.38 lakhs with workers working on this site and the muster rolls maintained properly. The Gram Sevak and the Programme Officer (BDO) were also aware and responsive. The work site had proper planning and drainage along the side of the road. This road has plantation to protect it from the erosion. Work site facilities were noticed in the form of drinking water and crutch facilities though First-Aid kit was not available.
- In almost all places wage payments through bank accounts were faster than through Post Offices because of procedural delays. If the payment of wages is made through Banks, the scenario is likely to improve further.

- There are many cases of single beneficiaries. For example one dug well was a permissible work under MGNREGA in Bopgaon, Pune District in the fields of a farmer having 3.5 acres of land. The cost of the borewell was ₹ 1.19 lakh. The location of the well was suitable which was having good catchment area but the selection process adopted for allocation of asset was not very clear and transparent. Majority of the works are the wish list of the local community under the individual works category. No BPL/ SC/ST criteria seem to have been followed. They also exceed permissible wage material ratio of 60:40 with little scope of providing employment.
- Some activities were working well under MGNREGA as in the case of recharging of borewell at Misalwadi, Bopgaon in Pune District. This community bore well fulfilling the need of drinking water of the community with a cost of only ₹16,102/-, was good and cost effective. Another example was Baramati Link road between Padmai Wasti to Limbachamala in Jalgaon Supe Village block with a cost of ₹ 5.55 lakh which was a completed work with a wage material ratio of 69:31 and generated 3214 persondays.
- There are also cases, where Gram Panchayats simply start activities to use the MGNREGA funds without even planning the benefit from the works. For example in Jalgaon Supe village in Baramati, in a nursery, sapplings of tamarind and drumsticks were grown to be planted on an adjacent 55 acres of common land. This is a case of bad planning by the Panchayat for the large 55 acres of common land and using MGNREGA funds for non-productive purpose. The drumstick sapplings had grown over 8-9 feet and perhaps would not survive on transplantation. The area is known for farming of high return crops like pomegranate and grapes and these high yielding plants could have been planted in the 55 acres of common land available in the same village area.
- Better Planning could also have been done in the case of watershed activities at Bopgaon in the local hill temple area which is managed by Forest Department under Haryali scheme and work provided under MGNREGA scheme. Though water trenches have been dug and gully plugging done, planting of saplings has not started. Moreover, this work solely depends on the back-up support and day-to-day management by the forest officials. Such activity devoid of involvement of local community is difficult to succeed due to lack of ownership and sense of belongingness.
- In most cases, no complaint of less payment was reported by the beneficiaries though delayed payment was reported which was ranging from 1-3 months.

## b) National Rural Livelihoods Mission (NRLM)/ "Aajeevika":

The different related schemes, TRYSEM, SITRA, DWCRA and MWS were merged into a single self-employment programme namely Swarnjayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY), to be implemented by the States, with effect from April, 1999. SGSY had the objective of improving the family incomes of the rural poor while at the same time, providing for capacity building of the poor, credit availability, technology transfer/up-gradation, marketing and infrastructure development. The SGSY has been restructured as National Rural Livelihoods Mission (NRLM), subsequently renamed as "Aajeevika", to implement it in a mission mode across the country and was formally launched on 3rd June, 2011. From its inception in April 1999, 42.05 lakh self-help groups (SHGs) have been formed under the SGSY with women SHGs accounting for about 60 per cent of the total. During 2013-14, the total number of SHGs under NRLM fold is13,15,437 of which 2,19,061 (or 17 per cent) have been mobilized in this financial year. Allocation for NRLM for 2013-14 has been kept at ₹4000 crore, an increase of ₹85 crore over the previous year's budget estimates (BE). Of this, an amount of ₹858.41crore has been released up to September, 2013.

Several evaluation studies<sup>3</sup> have shown that the rural livelihoods programmes have been relatively successful in alleviating rural poverty wherever systematic mobilization of the poor into SHGs, their capacity building and skill development, and forward and backward linkages were taken up in a process-intensive manner. Dedicated administrative structures consisting of professionals from the market, created in Andhra Pradesh, Kerala, Tamil Nadu, etc. for taking up these tasks have immensely contributed to the success of SHG movement there. But elsewhere in the country, in the absence of dedicated professional implementation structures and systematic social mobilization and institution building activities, the progress of the scheme has been rather slow. Besides various states are at different stages of progress in terms of institution building and hence require state-specific strategies. Common centralized guidelines/strategies would not meet the needs of all the states. Hence differentiated or state specific strategies need to be developed to cater to the specific requirements of each individual State.

## **Results of Sample Survey**

The sample survey findings related to the SGSY/NRLM are as follows:

• The SGSY/NRLM scheme has been working well in many places. For example, Alur G.P. of Kundapura Taluk is known for its pottery work. One of the beneficiaries, a potter was getting an average profit of Rs. 1 lakh a month and does not face any problem in marketing his product even at the local market. He has

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Annual Report 2012-13, pp 24-25 by Ministry of Rural Development, GoI.

also visited Delhi many a times for Gram Shilp Melas and IITF Melas sponsored by the Ministry of Rural Development under NRLM. However, while pot-making has picked up well, other activities have not and villagers were not aware of other activities for which government support is available.

- SGSY/NRLM scheme involving SHGs has done very well in many places. For example, in the Vanadana Mahila SHG at Shyanboganahalli, Mysore District the main activity is making agarbathis. Members of the SHG are economically independent and supplementing their family income. Some of the members' children have completed professional courses/degrees like medical and engineering. This SHG has also put the condition that the house should have a toilet if the loan facility from SHG is to be availed. The SHG 'Vandana Mahila' under SGSY scheme, is a good example of how women gain self-confidence by such self-employment ventures. However, more information about markets is needed for them as their main sales are in and around Mysore. There is also need for infrastructure support to benefit from the forward linkages. Such SHGs need to be informed of the exhibitions being held in different parts of the country and the facilities available. Industry, Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises, departments (both Central and State) can help these type of SHGs by organizing various markets/ fairs for marketing their products. Thus marketing facilities and even quality certification can help them. Proper guidance is also needed as they had labelled a herbal Agarbatti as Masala Agarbatti.
- Another example is the Hospitality Training Centre in Aurangabad. A Pratham Arora Center for Education (PACE) residential training facility center has been set up at Nandrabad Block-Khultabad. The hospitality course comprises 3 streams – Food and Beverage, Housekeeping and Bakery. Course curriculum has been developed in consultation with affiliated knowledge partner – Taj group of Hotels and Resorts. The eligibility criteria for joining is minimum 8<sup>th</sup> Pass and above 18 years of age to encourage participation from youth who had very little or no formal education. Course duration is of 3 months and upon completion of the course, all the students are placed through campus interviews with affiliated Placement partners like Taj Group of Hotels and Resorts. This training centre is equipped with dormitory, class rooms, Demo rooms, Computer lab and other necessary infrastructure and over 450 students have been trained out of which 420 have currently been placed. The fee for hospitality training programme is ₹ 14500/which has to be paid in the duration of the course. For students below poverty line whose economic constraints do not allow them to pay the entire course fee upfront, District Rural Development Agency (DRDA), Aurangabad has made an agreement with the PACE Foundation for paying ₹ 7500/- per candidate upfront fees as a subsidy after thorough verification and to give the remaining amount of ₹ 7000/-

per candidate as a virtual loan, allowing them to return the amount on a monthly basis after placement. The course fee includes training, lodging, lunch, breakfast and dinner, uniform, study material etc. for the entire course duration. One issue in this context is that as per NRLM guidelines, the maximum amount to be spent over each BPL candidate for skill up-gradation training is ₹ 7500/- per candidate for a minimum 30 days course. So policy changes regarding 100 per cent upfront payment needs to be drafted through NRLM. Another issue is the need to plan for future expansion of activities as a lot of investment on infrastructure like building has been done for one activity i.e. hospitality services. There is a need to broaden and diversify the activities.

• Another example is the Self Help Groups (SHGs) under NRLM in Palod, Khultabad block. Their performance has been good as can be seen in Table 3:

Table 3

| Sl<br>No | Name of<br>SHG           | Members | Date of<br>Formation | Bank<br>Savings<br>(₹) | Total savings till date (₹) | Interlending amount (₹) | Activity preferred    |
|----------|--------------------------|---------|----------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| 1        | Jivanjyoti<br>SHG        | 10      | 19.10.2011           | 1000/-                 | 18000/-                     | 10000/-                 | Tailoring machines    |
| 2.       | Ramrahim<br>SHG          | 10      | 24.12.2011           | 1000/-                 | 16000/-                     | 30000/-                 | Woolen blankets       |
| 3.       | Sabka<br>Malik Ek<br>SHG | 10      | 06.03.2012           | 1000/-                 | 14000/-                     | 13000/-                 | Goat<br>rearing       |
| 4.       | Sainath<br>SHG           | 10      | 01.12.2011           | 1000/-                 | 17000/-                     | 25000/-                 | Kolhapuri<br>chappals |

To all the above SHGs' revolving fund cash credit of Rs. 50000/- has been sanctioned in March 2013 by State Bank of India Branch, Anvi Block, Sillod and all SHGs are formed by the NGO "Bhairaveshwar Mahila Mandal. The SHGs are given technical as well as book keeping training through Rural Self Employment Training Institute (RSETI) and in due course, these will be granted subsidy to the key activity with a subsidy credit ratio of 1:3. A protocol is also being formulated with existing marketing set ups with the help of the chamber of commerce members as well as private and government sector officials for forward linkages for each of the product produced by the SHGs.

• The SGSY scheme has also been working well in Nooralbettu (Edu Village) with beneficiaries having their own tailoring shops, beauty parlours etc. But the support given to buy cows is not fully successful as there is no scope for marketing. There is no milk collection van or centre and the beneficiaries had to sell locally. A collection van could be made available for this purpose. There is also a need to

ensure that new cows are purchased while availing funds instead of merely showing cows already with beneficiaries as purchase of new cows.

#### c) National Rural Health Mission (NRHM):

The central outlay for health in the Twelfth Five Year Plan, has been increased by 200 per cent to ₹ 3,00,018 crore compared to the actual outlay of ₹ 99,491 crore in the Eleventh Five Year Plan. This outlay was primarily directed towards building on the initiatives taken in the Eleventh Plan period, for extending the outreach of public health services, and for moving towards the long-term objective of establishing the system of universal health coverage. In line with the National Health Policy 2002, the NRHM was launched on 12 April 2005 with the objective of providing accessible, affordable, and quality healthcare to the rural population and remote areas of the country both preventive and curative, which would include all aspects of a clearly defined set of healthcare entitlements including preventive, primary and secondary health services. Keeping in view the health related needs of the poor and the disadvantaged sections of the society, a provision of ₹ 20,999 crore has been made for a new proposed National Health Mission for rural and urban during 2013-14. An amount of ₹20,542 crore (BE) has been kept during 2012-13 under NRHM. For the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan period, the targets at the national level<sup>4</sup> are as under:

- Reduction of Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) to < 100 per 100000 live births
- Reducing Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) to < 27 per 1000 live births
- Reduction in Neonatal Mortality Rate (NMR) to < 18 per 1000 live births
- Reducing Total Fertility Rate (TFR) to 2.1
- Elimination of Filaria in all 250 districts; Kala-azar in all 514 Blocks and Leprosy in all districts
- Reduction in TB prevalence and mortality by 50 per cent
- Reduction in Annual Malaria incidence to <1/1000 population.
- Reduction in Japanese encephalitis (JE) mortality by 50 per cent
- Sustaining case fatality rate of less than 1per cent for Dengue

With the advent of NRHM, India has made remarkable achievements in providing affordable healthcare facilities to the rural poor and also added over 1.56 lakh health human resources to the health system across the country (up to September 2013). Institutional deliveries in almost all the states show a quantum jump during NRHM period and majority of the new born children have been immunized in all the states of India. NRHM funds utilization has improved over the period at all levels. Sub Centers and PHCs have started using untied grants with decentralization under NRHM.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> http://www.nrhm.gov.in accessed on 12.09.2013 and Economic Survey 2012-12 by Ministry of Finance, GoI.

However, there are also some problems as indicated in different studies<sup>5</sup> and reports which are as follows:

- Physical infrastructure: Since inception of NRHM, a large number of CHCs, PHCs, and SCs have been added to rural health services in India. However, the functioning of CHCs, HCs, and SCs on 24x7 basis is still below the requirement. The infrastructure is also substantially short of Indian Public Health Standards (IPHS) norms.
- Human resource: There is a shortage of human resource in public health institutions with shortfalls of even specialists/post-graduate doctors, gynaecologists, staff nurses and anesthetists in almost all the states. However, contractual appointments of specialists in CHCs seem to have partially strengthened the human resource in all the states but still have not been able to fill the gap between requirement and in-position specialists.
- Referral and emergency transport: This system seems to be working quite efficiently in some of the states like Madhya Pradesh, Jharkhand, Assam and Tamil Nadu. However, in most of the districts in Uttar Pradesh, Orissa and J&K, the Mobile Medical Units are not working. Besides inefficient emergency transport system is hampering the outreach of health care services.
- Case load: case load at district hospitals (DH) and sub-district hospitals (SDHs) is higher possibly due to higher referral cases from lower category of health facilities like CHCs, PHCs and Sub Centres, which in turn could be because of lack of human resources and infrastructural facilities at lower levels of health institutions. Most of the PHCs are functioning as 4/6 bedded hospitals.
- The National Disease Control Programme (NDCP): Though NDCP seems to be working well in all the selected 37 districts of 7 states in the sense that both the incidence as well as deaths reported under different diseases depict declining trend, this programme is still functioning separately and there is need for integration.
- Hospital Maintenance or initiatives under PPP are still lacking particularly in Uttar Pradesh. Even peripheral services like cleaning, washing, catering, etc. have not been outsourced in many districts.
- Quality of services is seriously affected by shortage of staff nurses at all levels of facilities. Women delivering new born babies also don't stay for minimum 48 hours after delivery because of lack of basic facilities like cleanliness, electricity,

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Evaluation Study of National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) in 7 States 2011 by Planning Commission, GoI.

potable water, etc. Bio-waste management is also very poor in most of the health facilities. In most of the DHs and CHCs these services are outsourced because of which collection and segregation processes are observed. In other lower facilities like PHCs and SCs even pits are not being properly constructed and maintained.

• Capacity building: Although trained ASHA's are recruited in all the states, in some states they are not trained properly and in some states even the guidelines for the selection of ASHA workers are not followed properly. The existing training infrastructure like medical colleges, nursing training institutes, etc. does not match with the required level of infrastructure. Besides there is no rationalization of posting and transfer policies for medical and health management personnel which affect the credibility and sustainability of health care.

# **Results of Sample Survey**

The survey results show that the public Health Centres (PHCs) were performing well in most places. But each of the PHCs had its own peculiarities both in terms of performance and problems.

- The PHC at Edu Village, Udupi, despite having good infrastructure, was working much below its potential. This was because the location of this PHC was not very suitable to attract patients of nearby villages. Even the local community being relatively affluent preferred to go to the private nursing homes close by. The role of the PHC was only as a day-care centre and though on an average 5-6 maternity cases every month are received, they refer those to the nearby hospitals for delivery. The reason for this is the preference of the local community and also the fact that there was only one medical officer who did not stay at the centre as there was no residential facility. There were also no sanctioned posts of staff nurse. It had two ANMs against the sanctioned posts of 3 ANMs with six ASHAs for field work. The post of Pharmacist was also vacant.
- Another Centre at Alur Village, Udupi had 2 medical officers, one a regular and another contractual, 10 ASHAs and 5 ANMs. Here also the pharmacist post was vacant and there was no sanctioned post of staff nurse. In the absence of staff nurse, it was difficult for doctors to attend to the 45-50 patients on a daily basis. This PHC despite having all necessary infrastructure and facilities of conducting deliveries and the right motivation was not taking up these activities and referred the cases to the district hospitals at the time of delivery which also defeats the very purpose of such huge investment by the Government in such PHCs. There were no residential facilities for doctors nearby. If necessary support is provided in the form of posting of staff nurse, pharmacist and residential quarters for the medical

officers at the PHCs, these Centres would turn out to be fruitful centres fulfilling the various objectives of the NRHM. In fact, out of 59 PHCs in Udupi district, 33 did not have sanctioned post of staff nurse. The sub-centre of this PHCs was located in the same compound reflecting lack of planning by the authorities as it serves no purpose being in the vicinity of the PHC itself.

- The Community Health Centre at Thagaduru, Mysore district is an example of wrong location as it was in an isolated place in the outskirts of the village. The Centre has good diagnostic and infrastructural facilities. But there is a shortage of doctors and other technical staff. While the total sanctioned post of the CHC (including doctors) is 36, presently only 16 staff are working. Though, the centre has excellent facilities, doctors feared their safety as there were even cases of manhandling. The lady doctors did not stay overnight and the hospital with more than 30 beds did not admit in-patients. Even the staff strength was less and no conveyance facility was available. Since changing the location now is not feasible there could at least be a team of male doctors who could come and serve the village by rotation. Computerisation of medicines issued to the patients and installation of scanning and X- Ray machines are the other things needed.
- The PHC at Balor, Block Sillod, Aurangabad district is functioning efficiently with delivery cases of 32 to 34 every month. The labour room was found to be very neat and clean. There is also a good stock of necessary medicines. There is a regular medical officer, 2 ANMs, one pharmacist and 30 ASHAs with kits. The regular medical officer resides in the dedicated quarters in the campus and is available round the clock. However, given the huge number of maternity cases another doctor is needed. There is also shortage of staff nurses. The services of 64 contractual ANMs have been discontinued for want of funds and the matter is subjudice. There are also small, but important things like the need for back-up battery of the inverter in the labour room which has expired and no replacement was made available to this PHC. The doctor had to take out the back-up battery of the desk top computer installed with his PC in OPD to the Labour Room in case of emergency.
- The sub-centre (Ayurvedic Centre) at Bopgaon, Purandar Block and PHC at Morgaon in Baramati block in Pune district were functioning well. Due to the initiatives of the health officers, the MMR & IMR was significantly brought down during 2013 in the district. The MMR & IMR in the whole of Pune district during 2011-12 was 60 and 18 which has come down to 53 and 14 respectively in the year 2012-13.

• In some places, new techniques like telemedicine were introduced in government hospitals. For example, in the district hospital at Aundh, Pune, telemedicine has been introduced recently to communicate with specialists and consultants of other hospitals of the district for faster consultation. Since Pune is a developed district in IT Sector where all blocks are well connected with internet facilities, the PHCs at the block level could also introduce the system of telemedicine, as the district already has the software for this purpose, which could benefit even the rural patients.

# d) Sarva Siksha Abhiyan (SSA):

SSA is a Government of India's flagship programme for achievement of universalization of elementary education (UEE) in a time bound manner, as mandated by the 86<sup>th</sup> amendment to the Constitution of India making free and compulsory Education to the Children of 6-14 years age group, a fundamental right. SSA is being implemented in partnership with state governments to cover the entire country and address the needs of 192 million children in 1.1 million habitations.<sup>6</sup> In line with this objective, the Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education (Amendment) Act 2012, became operational in the country on 1 April 2010. The programme seeks to open new schools in those habitations which do not have schooling facilities and strengthen existing school infrastructure through provision of additional class rooms, toilets, drinking water, maintenance grant and school improvement grants. Existing schools with inadequate teacher strength are provided with additional teachers, while the capacity of existing teachers is being strengthened by extensive training, grants for developing teaching-learning materials and strengthening of the academic support structure at a cluster, block and district level. SSA seeks to provide quality elementary education including life skills. SSA has a special focus on girl's education and children with special needs. SSA also seeks to provide computer education to bridge the digital divide. Significant reduction in the number of out-of-school children on account of SSA interventions has been noted. The number of out-of-school children has come down from 134.6 lakh in 2005 to 81.5 lakh in 2009 as per an independent study conducted by the Social and Rural Research Institute (SRI)-International Marketing Research Bureau (IMRB). An amount of ₹ 27,258 crore was provided during 2013-14 for RTE-SSA which has increased by 6.7 per cent over 2012-13 BE. The overall spending in school education has increased significantly to 16.2 per cent in 2013-14 (BE) from ₹ 42729 crore in 2012-13 (RE). The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) said the country has progressed the most in the world in sending children to schools by committed implementation of its right to education law and universal elementary education programme. India has made the largest progress (in absolute terms) by any country in the world reducing out-of-

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> http://www.ssa.nic.in accessed on 12.09.2013 and Economic Survey 2012-13 by Ministry of Finance, GoI.

school (children) numbers from 20 million in 2000 to 2.3 million in 2006, and (around) 1.7 million in 2011<sup>7</sup>.

Despite the progress made in SAA, there are some shortcomings and problems as well. The status of education in India in various reports highlights the following:

- Parents prefer to send their sons to private schools where as the girl child is sent to government schools.<sup>8</sup>
- Though the country is marching ahead in terms of enrolment of children in primary schools, the bigger concern is for those children who are lost during their transition from one class to another. Since 2000, enrolment has gone up significantly. But many students are only in school registers. In India, the attendance rate is around 76.0 per cent in 2009-10 and the dropout rate is nearly 40.6 per cent in 2010-11 at the upper primary level<sup>9</sup>. These are not comfortable numbers at all. SSA has failed to achieve its goals due to high dropout rate in the primary schools in the bigger states like Rajasthan, West Bengal, Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and Jharkhand<sup>10</sup>.
- Schooling of children of migrant labourers is another challenge before the government. The migrant children face the challenge of a different language, a different culture and teachers from a different culture speaking in a different language. A different syllabus, examination system or certification will not be helpful for them to continue education after returning to their native places after migration season. <sup>11</sup>
- On an average, about 90 per cent schools that received the money reported spending a bulk of their money on essential supplies, including whitewashing and school events between April, 2010 and November, 2011 under SSA. Of the total budget, teachers accounted for the largest share at 44 per cent and school infrastructure accounted for the second largest share with an allocation of 36 per cent while the children received only 10 per cent<sup>12</sup>.

22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> UNESCO Study: "Number of out of school children stagnate; aid to basic education falls by six per cent" published in Times of India dated June 10, 2013

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Progress Overview of Research 2011, SSA, EDCIL (India) Limited, A Government of India Enterprise.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Statistics of School Education 2010-11 as on 30.09.2012 by Ministry of Human Resource Development, GoI and Survey for Assessment of Dropout Rates at Elementary Level in 21 States, January 2013 submitted by TNS India Pvt Ltd to EDCIL

Progress Overview of Research 2011, SSA, EDCIL (India) Limited, A Government of India Enterprise.

Out of School Children: A collection of case studies of good practices adopted by States for different categories of out-of-school children under AIE component of SSA January 5, 2007 by Ministry of Human Resource Development, GoI

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> PAISA Report 2011: Do Schools Get Their Money? by PRATHAM

• The ASER report says there has not been much progress in compliance with various RTE-related norms. Despite the increase in SSA infrastructure budget, the proportion of schools with shortfall in the number teachers, classrooms, drinking water facilities, kitchen/shed, playground, complete boundary wall, a separate room for the headmaster has not increased much or remained more or less unchanged.<sup>13</sup>

#### **Results of sample Survey**

The survey results are as follows:

- The SSA scheme is performing well in many places. For example in the higher primary school at Alur G.P, Udupi district, there was a good stock of books and learning material at the school premises which could be distributed to the students. There was also 100 per cent result in 12<sup>th</sup> standard with 3 distinctions from this school. The highest percentage of marks was 93 per cent. Thus, performance of this school can be rated as commendable. The cooks for the Mid-day Meal are drawn from circle groups and Stree Shakti- a local women empowerment group. There were also separate toilets for girls, constructed at the cost of ₹ 1.85 lakhs. It was of very good quality having tiles up to 7 feet with good quality cisterns which were functioning. Though there was no regular cleaning staff, the headmaster was managing with some local arrangements with the gram panchayat. The Administration provides only bleaching powder and phenyl but the question is who will clean the toilets since no regular safai karamchari is available. This needs to be addressed. There was also shortage of drinking water facility at the school.
- Some schools have also introduced E- learning as in the case of the primary school Bopgaon in Pune district where there were 10 computers purchased with the help of Rotary Club and class 6 & 7 students were taught basics in computer learning.
- However, there were places where the situation was not as good as in other places. For example in Bopgaon village, Purandar Block, Pune district, there were only two classrooms in the school. The students of two classes i.e. standard 1 & 2 and standard 3 & 4 were sitting together in the same class-room. This is because of the the RTE Act mandate to have a school within 1 km. of radius of every habitat. This provision has been made to ensure that every child gets the opportunity of having a school within his habitation itself. But the two schools at Bopgaon and Savkarmala were not having the required number of students that would make the school eligible for having more than two class rooms and as such students of 4 classes were made to sit together in two class rooms which compromise the entire

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> ASER Report 2012 Press release dated 17.06.2013 by PRATHAM

learning environment. Since the size of the class rooms were big enough, at least temporary ply board partition could have been made to provide exclusiveness to each class and improve learning environment, though the problem of having only 2 teachers in the school would persist. Four classes were conducted in 2 rooms in some other schools also and there were only 2 teachers to handle 4 classes. This highlights the need to modify the RTE Act which says that there should be a school within 1 km radius of every habitat. This has led to having many small schools nearby with fewer teachers to handle many classes and construction of many school buildings with few class-rooms. Even teachers feel that students could go to nearby schools. What is needed is only the transport facility and not a school for every 1 km radius of habitat. The RTE Act needs to be amended for this. There is also a need to have teachers who can teach special subjects like Maths and English.

# e) Mid-day Meal (MDM) Scheme:

To enhance enrolment, retention & attendance and simultaneously improve nutritional levels among children, the National Programme of Nutritional Support to Primary Education (NP-NSPE) was launched as a Centrally Sponsored Scheme on 15<sup>th</sup> August 1995. In 2001 MDM scheme became a cooked MDM scheme under which every child in every government and government aided primary school was to be served a prepared MDM with a minimum content of 300 calories of energy and 8-12 gram protein per day for a minimum of 200 days. The Scheme was further extended in 2002 to cover not only children studying in government, government aided and local body schools, but also children studying in Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) and Alternative & Innovative Education (AIE) centres. In September 2004 the Scheme was revised to provide for central assistance for cooking cost @ ₹1 per child per school day to cover cost of pulses, vegetables cooking oil, condiments, fuel and wages and remuneration payable to personnel or amount payable to agency responsible for cooking. Transport subsidy was also raised from the earlier maximum of ₹50 per quintal to ₹100 per quintal for special category states and ₹75 per quintal for other states. Central assistance was provided for the first time for management, monitoring and evaluation of the scheme @ 2 per cent of the cost of foodgrains, transport subsidy and cooking assistance. A provision for serving mid-day meal during summer vacation in drought affected areas was also made. In July 2006, the scheme was further revised to enhance the cooking cost to ₹1.80 per child/school day for states in the North Eastern Region and ₹1.50 per child / school day for other states and UTs. The nutritional norm was revised to 450 calories and 12 gram of protein. In order to facilitate construction of kitchen-cum-store and procurement of kitchen devices in schools, provision for central assistance @ ₹ 60,000 per unit and @ ₹ 5,000 per school in phased manner was made. In October 2007, the scheme was extended to cover children of upper primary classes (i.e. class VI to VIII) studying in 3,479 Educationally Backwards Blocks (EBBs) and the name of the scheme was changed from 'National Programme of Nutritional Support to Primary Education' to 'National Programme of Mid-Day Meal in Schools'. The nutritional norm for upper primary stage was fixed at 700 calories and 20 grams of protein. The scheme was extended to all areas across the country from 1.4.2008. The scheme was further revised in April 2008 to extend the scheme to recognized as well as unrecognized madarsas/maqtabs supported under SSA. In India, nearly 120 million children are receiving free lunch at school each day. Combined, the scale and the effectiveness of this program make it an example of a successful government program improving the well-being of its citizens. The midday meal scheme has succeeded in improving nutritional status of school going children and enhanced school attendance enrolment and retention especially for girls and children of disadvantaged groups (SCs and STs)<sup>14</sup>. Under the MDM scheme, in 2012-13, 10.68 crore children were provided hot cooked meal in 12.12 lakh schools in the country. During 2012-13, 12.13 lakh schools have been provided with kitchen devices and 25.48 lakh cook-cum-helper have been appointed by the State to prepare and serve the mid-day meals to the school children. Besides 6.26 lakh kitchen-cumstores have been constructed to ensure safety of foodgrains and provisioning of hygienic and nutritious meals to the children.

However, there are also some shortcomings like the following in the Mid-day Meal scheme as pointed out by different reports and studies:<sup>15</sup>

- Most of the complaints related to quality of food at government schools arise from poor hygiene. The cooks in government schools do not wear caps or gloves, and are not checked for disease. This could lead to food poisoning. Some schools do not have adequate infrastructure and have no running water. Unhygienically cooked and under-nutritious foods are major issues affecting the scheme. 16
- The scheme suffers from structural problems, the biggest being the lack of a proper monitoring mechanism and lack of proper accountability. There is no clear defined structure, and every state runs it functions according to its wish. Besides the huge corruption at all levels is destroying the scheme.<sup>17</sup>
- Most of the states, it was observed, did not follow the guidelines of Government of India to deliver foodgrains at the school point by PDS dealer, thereby resulting in the leakage of foodgrains.<sup>18</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Performance Evaluation of Cooked Mid-Day Meal (CMDM) May, 2010 by PEO, Planning Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Performance Evaluation of Cooked Mid-Day Meal (CMDM) May, 2010 by PEO, Planning Commission.

 $<sup>^{16}</sup>$  ASER 2012 Report facilitated by PRATHAM published on January 17, 2013 and other studies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Lack of monitoring, corruption plague mid-day meal scheme published in The Economic Times July 28, 2013.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Performance Evaluation of Cooked Mid-Day Meal (CMDM) May, 2010 by PEO, Planning Commission.

- The scheme is doing well in southern states as compared to Northern India. In northern states in some places NGOs are providing the meal and the payment is low, and delayed. When they do not get payment for 5-6 months, they lose their morale. 19
- The attitude of school authorities towards the children is also a major issue. The school authorities treat the children as a burden and the manner of distributing the meal is not dignified. In some schools bias against lower caste exits while serving the meal.<sup>20</sup>
- A lot of children are from very poor families. They come without having breakfast, and so they cannot study in the first half as they are hungry. In some schools, the process of distributing lunch takes two hours or more and by that time, the school time is over and leaves no time for the child to study.<sup>21</sup>

## **Results of Sample Survey**

The results of the survey are as follows:

- The Mid-day Meal scheme was working well in the schools visited. In the government primary school at Kembalu, Nanjangud, Mysore district, there were 50 students and three teachers in the school. The scheme was working well but there was no door for the store room, which needs to be installed.
- In Tandavpura village, Mysore district, 358 students are studying in the school and the food served under MDM programme was good. There were proper doors for stores in schools where mid-day meal scheme is implemented. One of the schools had even obtained idli vessels (by donations) and served idli to students using the same provisions given to them. However, students were having lunch in the corridors of the school as there was no common dining room for the students and there was no cover from rains.
- In the primary school in Bopgaon, Pune district there was proper storage facilities (Tin boxes) for rice and other grains in the school for MDM Scheme and the quality of the grains was satisfactory.

#### f) Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA):

Rural sanitation came into focus in the Government of India in the World Water Decade of 1980s. The Central Rural Sanitation Programme (CRSP) was started in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Performance Evaluation of Cooked Mid-Day Meal (CMDM) May, 2010 by PEO, Planning Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Performance Evaluation of Cooked Mid-Day Meal (CMDM) May, 2010 by PEO, Planning Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Performance Evaluation of Cooked Mid-Day Meal (CMDM) May, 2010 by PEO, Planning Commission.

1986 to provide sanitation facilities in rural areas. It was simply a supply driven, high subsidy and infrastructure oriented programme. As a result of deficiencies and low financial allocations, the CRSP had very little impact on this big problem. The experience of community driven, awareness generating campaign based programme in some states and the results of evaluation of CRSP, led to the formulation of Total Sanitation Campaign (TSC) approach in 1999. Total Sanitation campaign was launched in April 1999, with a shift from a high subsidy to a low subsidy regime, a greater household involvement and demand responsiveness, and providing for the promotion of a range of toilet options to promote increased affordability. The TSC gives emphasis on Information, Education and Communication (IEC) for demand generation of sanitation facilities, providing for stronger back-up systems such as trained masons and building materials through rural sanitary marts and production centers and including a thrust on school sanitation as an entry point for encouraging wider acceptance of sanitation by rural masses as key strategies. It also lays emphasis on school sanitation and hygiene education for bringing about attitudinal and behavioral changes for relevant sanitation and hygiene practices from a young age. In TSC, fund is earmarked for activities like construction of toilets in households, schools, Anganwadis, public places, setting up of RSMs/PCs as well as activities like awareness creation, capacity building of different stakeholders, start-up activity like conducting baseline survey and administrative expenses.<sup>22</sup>

In 2012, the TSC has been revamped as Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA), which has been launched with modified guidelines and objectives to further accelerate sanitation coverage in the rural areas so as to comprehensively cover the rural community with renewed strategies. NBA has brought major changes in the rural sanitation programme by widening the provision of incentive for individual household latrine units to cover identified Above Poverty Line (APL) households who belong to Scheduled Castes (SC) /Scheduled Tribes (ST), small and marginal farmers, landless labourers with homesteads, physically challenged and women headed households along-with all Below Poverty Line (BPL) households. Under NBA, incentive has been increased to ₹ 4600 (₹ 3200 from centre + ₹ 1400 from state) + ₹ 500 extra for hilly and difficult areas from Centre. Additional financial assistance up to ₹ 4500/- per individual house hold latrines (IHHL) has been provided in convergence with MGNREGA for all eligible beneficiaries. NBA envisages covering the entire community for saturated outcomes with a view to create nirmal gram panchayats (NGPs) with following priorities:<sup>23</sup>

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Total Sanitation Campaign - Sanitation for All: 2012 and Annual Report 2011-12 by Ministry of drinking Water and Sanitation accessed on 26.08.2013 from <a href="http://www.mdws.gov.in">http://www.mdws.gov.in</a>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Background Note and Agenda for National Consultation with State Ministers and State Secretaries In-charge of Rural Sanitation, 20-21st December, 2012, Ministry of Drinking Water & Sanitation, GoI

- a) Provision of IHHL of both BPL and Identified APL households within a Gram Panchayat (GP).
- b) Gram Panchayats having 100 per cent piped water supply will be given priority, Provision of sanitation facilities in government schools and anganwadis in government buildings within these GPs.
- c) Solid and liquid waste management (SLWM) for proposed and existing Nirmal Grams
- d) Extensive capacity building of the stake holders like panchayati raj institutions (PRIs), Village water and sanitation committees (VWSCs) and field functionaries for sustainable sanitation.
- e) Appropriate convergence with MGNREGA

According to Census 2011, 32.7 per cent of rural households have latrine facilities, compared to 21.9 per cent as per Census 2001. The TSC renamed the NBA aims to transform rural India into 'Nirmal Bharat' and achieve 100 per cent access to sanitation for all rural households by 2022. Against the budget estimate of ₹4260 crore for the year 2013-14, ₹1052.06 crore have been released till September, 2013. A total of 16,29,583 individual household latrines, 19,353 school toilet units and 10,898 anganwadi toilets have been constructed till September, 2013 against the target of 60,00,000 individual household latrines, 70,000 school toilets and 30,000 angawadi toilets for 2013-14. A total of 28,002 gram panchayats, 181 intermediate panchayats, and 13 district panchayats have been awarded the Nirmal Gram Puruskar (NGP) in the last seven years up to November, 2012.<sup>24</sup>

This scheme has done well since inception but still there is a long way to go. Some issues which need to be addressed are the following: <sup>25</sup>

- Rural sanitation being a state subject, it is necessary that state governments accord high priority to the programme. Though most states have included TSC in their programmes, financial allocations for sanitation often are not adequate due to lack of priority attached to the programme which often takes a back seat to water which is a more politically important area. The states where high priority is attached, good results are seen e.g. West Bengal, Tripura, Kerala, Tamil Nadu, Maharashtra, etc.
- The second reason has been less emphasis on capacity building and IEC activities with inadequate capacity building at the cutting edge level for implementing a demand driven project. The implementation machinery at the field level, which is

Economic Survey 2012-13 by Ministry of Finance, GoI
 Handbook on Community Sanitation Systems by Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation

quite familiar with working of the supply driven, target oriented schemes of the government need to be sensitized further to the challenges of this demand driven approach. For this, change in attitude and ways of functioning of the persons responsible for the implementation of the scheme is needed.

 There are some other challenges like existence of state level high subsidy schemes in many states, provision of low cost and region specific technological options, quality of construction, usage and operation along with maintenance of the sanitation facilities and convergence with various other departments at national, state, district and grassroots levels.

# **Results of the Sample Survey**

The results of the survey are as follows:

- Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan (NBA)'s performance was good in some places. For example in the Model Village named as Yashwant gram at Bahirgaon, Malepur in Aurangabad district, the performance was very good and the gram panchayat has received "Nirmal Gram Puraskar" in March, 2006. The total population of Bahirgaon is 2394. It has total 382 households out of which, 241 households use individual toilets and 141 households use 32 public toilets. The village has 16 community latrines – 8 for women and 8 for men and it was heartening to know the way they handle the social issues collectively in an harmonious manner and anybody found defecating in open is fined Rs.1000 to Rs.5000. Bio-gas is generated from public toilet waste. The gram panchayat is 100 per cent tobacco free. It also has 'Tanta Mukti Samiti' which resolves quarrels at gram panchayat itself. Such model villages have been developed, in every block in Aurangabad where pooling of resources under various social sector interventions have been done and development activities carried out by the concerned gram panchayats under the constant guidance from the authorities. This village is declared free from all social tensions and has 100 per cent sanitation facilities. The lady Sarpanch was also a capable village leader and oversaw all the development activities herself.
- In Hulimavu, Mysore district, by converging two schemes namely, MGNREGA and NBA, toilets were constructed for each household in the village. Under Special Component Plan (for the Scheduled castes), toilet work was done and cemented roads were constructed. Wages paid for the construction of toilets were from MGNREGA scheme indicating better convergence. The toilet construction work in this SC colony at Hulimavu was really praiseworthy as it was done systematically with cement rings for the pits with space in-between the rings and

the roads were cemented and clean. Only, tap connections were needed for toilets, though the tanks nearby had taps.

# g) Related Social Sector Programme- National Horticulture Mission

There are some schemes in the area of horticulture which have been implemented by the horticulture department under National Horticulture Mission (NHM) that provide a source of income to the villagers.

The horticulture sector, with a wide array of crops — ranging from fruits and vegetables to orchids and nuts, mushrooms and honey has been a driving force in stimulating a healthy growth trend in Indian agriculture. India is the second largest producer of fruits and vegetables in the world and occupies the first position in the production of fruits like mango, banana, papaya, sapota, pomegranate, acid lime, aonla and vegetables like peas and okra. Development of horticulture is a focus area for the government and is being promoted through a number of schemes. National Horticulture Mission (NHM), a Centrally Sponsored Scheme to promote holistic growth of the horticulture sector is one among the schemes.

Interventions in horticulture including National Horticulture Mission (NHM) in the country, have led to increase in per capita availability of fruits and vegetables from 138 gm/person/day in 2005 to 172 gm/person/day in 2012. Similarly, per capita availability of vegetables has increased from 279 gm/person/day in 2005 to 350 gm/person/day in 2012.

Under implementation of NHM, all categories of farmers including women beneficiaries are covered in components like floriculture, beekeeping etc. As per directives of the Planning Commission, implementing agencies viz. State Horticulture Missions have been directed to ensure that at least 30% of budget allocation is earmarked for women beneficiaries/ farmers. Activities such as floriculture including protected cultivation of flowers, mushroom production and beekeeping are suitable to women farmers.

The NHM has also been facing some challenges which are as follows:

• One of the problems is related to cold storage sector with inadequate storing of more varieties of commodities in multi chambers. Another problem is lack of technology for storage of multiple products existing in Uttar Pradesh and Madhya Pradesh. These states suffer from the problem of high operational cost due to inefficient cold storage technology like diffuser system, poor quality insulation, insufficient thickness and mis-match of plant and machinery with the capacity.

Inadequate infrastructural facilities and low capacity utilisation of cold storage units in some states like Rajasthan might be due to low demand, more competition, low production and dependence on single commodity for storage.<sup>26</sup>

- There are also multiplicity of standards in several horticultural products. Standards for growing and packaging requirements for international markets are also not available in a large number of commodities. The standards developed by the Directorate of Marketing and Inspection are old and outdated. There is, therefore, an urgent need to not only rationalize the standards fixed by various organizations but also to harmonize this with ISO standards for different commodities. <sup>27</sup>
- Efficient credit management is also important in horticulture considering the high investment costs and longer gestation period. Current support system of credit under Credit Support Risk Management is not only costly but inefficient, inadequate and untimely. Therefore, there is a need for efficient credit support which should encourage investment to achieve higher production.<sup>28</sup>
- National Mission on Micro Irrigation Scheme has been launched from 2010-11 for both Horticultural & Non Horticultural crops. Since the last 3-4 years demand for micro irrigation is increasing every year due to scarcity of water resources in Maharashtra. Every year on an average 2.50 lakh hectares area is covered under micro irrigation for which funds of ₹ 750 crores are required every year. However, the State is getting about ₹ 250 crore as central assistance per year resulting in a lot of pending claims from 2009-10.<sup>29</sup>
- In most of the NHM worksites all over the States, NHM logo was not seen and the boards were not as per specification. The productivity potential is un-utilized due to inadequate irrigation facilities in Karnataka and the ground water levels has been depleting continuously. Highly perishable crops require intensive care which is ignored and commercial horticulture is yet to take strong roots. Inadequate farm mechanization and post-harvest technology (PHT), logistical deficiencies and lack of strong linkage of farms with market are the other weaknesses. 30

Cold Storage Units financed under Capital Investment Subsidy Scheme: An Impact Assessment by Department of Economic Analysis and Research, National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development, 2003, Mumbai, India.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Report of the Working Group on Horticulture Development for the 10<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan, June, 2001 by Planning Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Report of the Working Group on Horticulture Development for the 10<sup>th</sup> Five Year Plan, June, 2001 by Planning Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Report of the Joint Inspection Team for their visit to Maharashtra during 27th May to 3rd June, 2013 to review National Horticulture Mission Progress by Ministry of Agriculture, GOI

Report of the Joint Inspection Team on its visit to Karnataka during 3<sup>rd</sup> January to 12th January, 2013 review National Horticulture Mission Progress by Ministry of Agriculture, GOI

# **Results of the Sample Survey**

The results of the survey are as follows:

- The wholesale APMC fruit & flower market situated in the outskirts of Mysore is constructed under the National Horticulture Mission. It is relatively neat and clean. Most of the agricultural commodities produced in the nearby districts arrive in the early hours of the day. Some issues of the APMC market which could be addressed include: providing cold storage facilities in both the vegetable and flower markets, keeping a record of farmers who come regularly to this market, providing a place for resting/sleeping overnight for the farmers, addressing the menace of cattle which roam freely in the market, providing bus facility from the main road to the newly constructed market, providing health clinics/ doctors near the market, finding ways to avoid commission agents and makeing actual wholesale buyers to come to the market.
- In Kembalu, Nanjangud taluk, Mysore district, the Banana Growers Cluster is developed and supported by the Horticulture Department. In this cluster, under comprehensive horticulture development (CHD) scheme, farmers were educated to take up tissue culture banana in a new intervention involving high density, trench planting, mulching with drip irrigation as a compulsory component. A subsidy of 80 per cent for drip irrigation was extended under central scheme and subsidy for CHD tissue culture banana was provided at 50 per cent i.e., 55462 per acre for SC, ST and small and marginal farmers and at 40 per cent i.e Rs 44369 per acre for big farmers This cluster is working well and farmers are getting good income. Some suggestions for improvement include addressing the issue of non-inclusion of banana cultivation for crop insurance unlike other horticulture crops like coconut and potato and streamlining the sale of chemical fertilizers for farmers, as there was the practice of black marketing in the sale of fertilizers.
- The farm house of the Horticulture Department at Yalachanahalli, Mysore district developed hi-breed variety of plants for the farmers. It also supplies plants to schools and hospitals. This farm house has combined the work of other schemes like supplying nutritious plants to schools e.g., papayas, chakrapani (a leafy nutritious plant), etc., which can be used for mid-day meal. The farm house is huge and has huge tourism potential. If it is planned well, this area can be one of the destinations for tourists and can yield good income. However plants supplied by such farms to schools should be properly maintained. While some schools have maintained it, some others have not and plant-guards need to be installed in some schools where these were planted.

#### IV. Conclusion

Thus the different social sector programmes show varied performances in different places. While changes in the programmes are needed in some cases, in most of the cases it is the implementation and delivery related issues that need to be addressed. In some cases there is the need for greater awareness creation. The system in Mysore district of using a special van for creating greater awareness of the social sector programmes with the help of tailor-made short movies is worth emulating. Other districts can also purchase mobile vans with all necessary literature and information in electronic form relating to various development and social sector programmes being implemented by various line departments which can go from village to village on predecided dates and times, preferably on market days. This promotional electronic literature can be made in the local languages. Such efforts could go a long way in the success of the social sector programmes. These along with strengthening and empowering the basic institutions like Gram Sabhas/Gram Panchayats could not only help in promoting greater inclusiveness but also go a long way in developing human capital.

\*\*\*\*