

**SARVA SHIKSHA ABHIYAN (SSA)**

**6<sup>th</sup> Review Mission of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan  
Government of India**

**(16 - 26 July, 2007)**

**Aide Memoire**

**SARVA SHIKSHA ABHIYAN**  
**Sixth Review Mission, July, 2007**  
**Aide-Memoire**

**1. Introduction**

1.1 Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) is the Government of India's (GoI) flagship programme launched in 2001 to achieve the goal of Universalization of Elementary Education. The major goals of the programme are:

- All children in school by 2005.
- Focus on satisfactory quality with emphasis on education for life
- Bridging gender and social gaps in primary by 2007 and in elementary by 2010
- Universal retention by 2010

1.2 The programme envisages a bi-annual review (January and July) through review Missions. This Mission in July 2007 is the sixth review Mission of SSA. The terms of reference (TOR) for the Mission and details of the Mission composition are enclosed (Appendix 1)

1.3 The Mission's approach is one of learning - to understand the progress made under the programme and to indicate experiences that highlight strengths and weaknesses, with a view to strengthening implementation. The Mission has reviewed progress towards the programme goals. This review is based on our study of available documents and discussions with national and state level functionaries.

1.4 This is the Sixth Review Mission- a desk review. This Mission was rigorous with a lively, critical, and constructive exchange between Mission members, members of the MHRD Bureau, and most importantly, the representatives of the states. The process of half-yearly review, which is always undertaken in the spirit of learning, appears to have contributed to the independently continuing efforts of improving the processes and the situation at various levels. Several issues flagged by the previous Missions through their recommendations have been taken up and improved upon by the Ministry and the states.

1.5 The Mission records its deep appreciation of the support of the Department of Elementary Education and Literacy, GoI, the Technical Support Group, national

- institutions, and the State Governments in making available documents, providing insightful presentations and discussing issues in a transparent and candid manner.
- 1.6 Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan has proven to be one the of most successful missions launched by the Government of India with whole-hearted participation of states which is increasingly deepening down to the village-habitation, and school level. It is also a program that holds tremendous promise considering the best practices and energy it continues to generate.

## 2. **Achievements: some highlights:**

- 2.1 Several states have started exercises aimed at improving the levels of basic learning achievement on state-wide scale. Many pilots are now being scaled up state-wide. Most notable among these is the Tamil Nadu Activity Based Learning program. The Mission was also happy to see specific goal setting towards achievement of basic reading, writing, and math skills at every standard as represented by Himachal Pradesh. Combining overall improvement in classroom processes, teacher capacity building, and focus on basic skills learning is important.
- 2.2 Increased focus on quality on education from the fact that SSA conducted studies on teacher absence, students' attendance, students' time on task, and para-teachers. This is commendable and the findings of the latter two studies are awaited with interest.
- 2.3 The proportion of out of school children in the 6-13 age group, computed on the basis of door to door annual surveys by teachers, is reported to have dropped to about 3.5% (about 70 lac children) in 2004-05 and more or less stagnant ( about 75 lac children) in 2006-07 against an independently verified proportion of about **6.94%** in September 2005.
- 2.4 Gender gap is reported to be dropping steadily. Operationalization of the Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas are a major step forward in SSA as is indicated by the field review report. Its merger with SSA in the 11<sup>th</sup> plan is a very welcome step.

- 2.5 The dropout rates too continue to decline except in about 97 districts where they are stagnant. The national dropout rates before completing primary stage have dropped from 14.9% to 10.39% between 2002-03 and 2005-06. Simultaneously, the transition rates from primary to upper primary stage have risen by about 10 percentage points to 83.36%. This progress indicates that all children entering schools today could complete at least full eight years of education.
- 2.6 The program for Children With Special Needs is particularly important. It is reaching out to ever larger numbers of children and involves larger number of NGOs than previous years. Nearly 2.4 million children have been identified and about 2 million of these covered either through mainstreaming into schools or through home-based education with an involvement of 6,687 resource teachers and 687 NGOs.
- 2.7 The goals for provisioning of new schools, classrooms, toilets etc are being met to the extent of 91% with 67% completion and the rest in process. It is projected that the infrastructure gap in all except about 5 states will be insignificant, if any, by the end of 2007-08. Provision of a primary school within 1 km of 98% population is a gigantic achievement despite the unevenness. Similarly a primary school to upper primary school ratio of 2.61: 1, which is further declining favorably is also heartening news.
- 2.8 The District Information System for Education, DISE, that was initiated in seven states in 1994-95 has now expanded to cover all 35 states and UT's. More importantly, the time lag between data gathering and reporting has reduced dramatically. A couple of years ago the time lag was over two years. This Mission could get information for 2006-07 for 25 states at the beginning of the academic year 2007-08. Also, comparison with other sources of information indicates that the reliability of the data too has improved considerably. Several states including Orissa, Karnataka, and Himachal have moved beyond DISE to creating their own individual child database, which are used for tracking.
- 2.9 The Education Development Index is now applied nationwide. Although it is still in its early stages of trial and use, it is a promising tool in planning, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation.
- 2.10 The MHRD Bureau's data and also fund allocations have increasingly become more district, and even block-specific over the last year. It is good to see even cluster-

specific data indicating considerable improvement in micro-level planning. This is a major gain, which has clearly helped in targeting issues of unevenness that are often hidden under good overall figures. This is especially true of equity issues related to the girl child, SC/ST, and minorities. SSA has identified districts and blocks which have concentration of problems related to these social categories and extra efforts are being made supported by additional funding and flexible programs. These strategies should start yielding results in a short while.

2.11 SSA has undertaken or commissioned several studies which were either recommended by previous missions or were deemed necessary by the MHRD. This is another major step in SSA that will go a long way in evidence-based improvement in the reach and quality of education.

2.12 The mission applauds the decision to release 25% of total annual work plan to the states in the first month of the financial year. This will necessarily facilitate better financial planning and efficiency at all levels.

2.13 Web-based monitoring at state and district level is a powerful tool to monitor cash balance and fund flow. Many states reported during the review that the actual fund transfer of funds from state to the last village via districts takes under a month as required by SSA. The Mission appreciates this progress,

### **3. Challenges ahead**

3.1 Moving forward the challenges before SSA are two fold. One set of challenges are as regards further quantitative and qualitative improvement in all aspects of the program from reaching the un-reached children, classroom processes, to financial management. The other set of challenges is related to the mainstreaming and institutionalizing of all the best practices and gains for long term sustainability and continuous improvement.

3.2 This is the first year of the 11<sup>th</sup> Plan and a major change have been made in the funding pattern of the SSA from 75:25 to 50:50 from the year 2007-08. This has posed a major issue of whether states will be able to provide the substantially higher resources from last year's Rs. 3,700 crores to Rs. 10,000 crores, that being the SSA GOI provision for 2007-08. From the information provided, we understand that the states have committed Rs. 5000 crore in their AWP&B. This will permit the GOI to release only Rs. 5000 crores out of the Rs. 10,000 crore

- allocated. However, some of the north-eastern states have taken a much longer time to make even these commitments, resulting in the loss of provision for SSA activities in the first quarter of 2007-08. **MHRD has to resolve this issue to ensure that the pace and tempo of the project and the activities at the state level does not slacken or suffer on account of the change of funding pattern.**
- 3.3 Closing the access and equity gaps
- 1.1 Detailed micro-planning and targeted programmes will be required to bring the 70 lakhs out-of-school children, particularly from vulnerable sections.
- 1.2 Gender gap at upper primary level is decreasing unevenly at a pace slower than at the primary level. Provision of adequate number of schools, teachers and extensive community participation and mobilization is needed.
- 1.3 Inclusion of out of school minority children into the mainstream education system still remains a challenge and requires micro-level intervention including community awareness and mobilization.
- 1.4 Ensuring universal retention of all children enrolled in the system.
- 1.5 SSA's convergence with the state level social and tribal welfare departments for better collation of data and interventions to improve the retention and academic performance of SC/ST children..
- 1.6 Provision of sufficient schools and teachers at upper primary stage –especially in districts with high proportion of tribal and Muslim minority population.
- 1.7 Alternative and Innovative Strategies for urban children and children of migrating work force are a difficult problem. The performance of AIE projects is at about 50% and needs strengthening.
- 3.4 **Civil Works:** The completion rates for civil works in **only 67% with another 24% works in progress. The efficiency of completion off facilities have to be improved upon to ensure attainment of the goals by 2010.**
- 3.5 The Drinking Water Mission & Sanitation Department at the central level have given commitments to complete these facilities by 2007. **Ministry of HRD and States need to have closer and continuous coordination with these Departments to**

**ensure that the gap in these facilities is filled** by the target date. This is a project in a mission mode with yearly targets and clear outcomes for infrastructure. If not fulfilled, there will be slippage in the achievement of SSA goals.

### 3.6 **Quality**

- 3.6.1 The main challenge before SSA is to improve classroom processes and the quality of student learning. Reducing significantly student-absenteeism, drop-outs and out of school children will be largely dependent on the States vigorously pursuing effective programs of quality improvement of learning.
  - 3.6.2 Central to this challenge will be the revamp of the in-service training programs of teachers and strong follow up of such training. In-service training has reached a plateau with lot of fatigue in organizing year after year with hardly any tangible improvement in outcomes i.e. classroom teaching learning process.
  - 3.6.3 Identify teachers' needs in relation to helping their children to reach these learning outcome goals and design training modules to fulfill these needs under the leadership of DIET through BRCs & CRCs.
  - 3.6.4 Integration of SCERTs and DIETs where not happening in all their quality improvement programs, including in planning, supervision and evaluation of quality.
  - 3.6.5 High teacher absence rate in some large states is a major challenge and needs urgent steps.
- 3.7 Expenditure against allocation indicating efficient utilization of resources on quality component showed improvement in 2005-06 over the year 2004-05 at both national and state levels. **However, till 2006-07, only A&N Islands has shown a declining trend in terms of utilization of funds on quality.** There are States who have swinging trend on the same aspect which needs to be looked further

### 3.8 Programme Management

- 3.8.1 The state SSA structures should ensure that they function in cohesion and convergence with mainstream education department structures so that the benefits of the program especially in planning and implementation are fully sustained after the program as well. **We recommend that a study be conducted to assess the status of efforts to involve the mainstream education department structures in SSA planning and implementation processes.**
- 3.8.2 Specific efforts are needed for developing a vision of universal elementary education. The capacities of officers in the mainstream education departments should be strengthened so that they can gradually mainstream SSA strategies in their regular work.
- 3.8.3 Strengthening the financial and accounting process at the village school management committee level.
- 3.8.4 DISE is becoming an important instrument. It needs to be constantly strengthened and its reliability and accuracy needs to be improved with strengthening of data gathering and reporting systems.
- 3.8.5 Strengthening of the internal audit functions in all states is a challenge.

### 4. Follow up actions taken on the recommendations of the 5<sup>th</sup> JRM

- Recommendation 1: The question of schooling in very small habitations needs deliberation with the states and strategy needs to be evolved: Due to school construction programme under Xth plan, the percentage of habitations served with a primary school/section within 1 km has increase from 87.0% in 2002 to an estimated 98% now. As follow up, states have been advised and several have revised their policies and norms for serving remote sparsely populated tribal areas.
- Recommendation 2: The spread of upper primary facilities needs to be studied in detail to identify issues and challenges towards universal access to upper primary facilities: While 88,930 new upper primary (UPr) schools opened since 2002-03, the ratio of primary: UPr in 2004-05 was still 2.8:1. States were instructed in 2006-07 to project the gaps in their AWP&B 2007-08. Priority is being given to UPr school

infrastructure and 24,190 UPr schools have been sanctioned for 2007-08 under SSA by Project Approval Board.

- Recommendation 3: Special attention needs to be paid to ensuring high quality in civil works. Encouraging child-friendly school designs and strengthening, monitoring and supervision mechanisms are critical next steps: As a follow up action, a third party evaluation of civil works construction in 12 states has been carried out. Several of their state reports were presented to 6<sup>th</sup> Mission, which suggest that by and large the quality of newly constructed school infrastructure is good. Currently states are conducting third party independent evaluations. This year, on persuasion of states the other states have also started the process of independent third party evaluation during the current year.
- Recommendation 4 - Focus on the education of scheduled tribe and minority children as well as girls in the age group of 11-14,: During 2007-08 11.65%, 11.64% and 18.83% (based on information provided from a part of targeted districts (35 SC, 63 ST, and 44 of MCD) of total SSA allocations have been approved for 61 SC-, 106 ST- and 121 minority-concentration districts respectively. 457, 242 and 266 KGBVs have been sanctioned for Tribal, SC and Muslim concentration districts.
- Recommendation 5: Quality of education needs to continue in all its dimensions: A large number of quality related interventions are in evidence, too numerous to mention. Clearly the focus is shifting to quality issues.
- Recommendation 6: The implementation structures at SPO level needs to be strengthened and there is necessity for continuous capacity building at all levels: Capacity building programmes are an ongoing effort.
- Recommendation 7: The role and function of community based bodies such as VECs and PTAs to be deliberated and shared among States. Rigorous and intensive capacity building of such bodies as well as greater transparency and accountability are required: Training programs for community leaders have been put in place.

## **5. Improving Access**

### **5.1 Enrollment, Out of school children and attendance**

- 5.1.1 The number of out of school children is reported to have dropped in 2005-06 to about 70 lac children and stayed more or less constant or slightly increased to 75 lac nationwide. The state of Bihar contributes 22.6% of all out of school children and 60% percent of all out of school children are in 3 states- Bihar, UP and West

Bengal. The number of districts with more than 50,000 children out of school has come down to just 24 districts. The SSA is also looking at districts with more than 20,000 out of school children. This way, the required emphasis on getting all children in school will not be lost.

- 5.1.2 As compared to projections of the commissioned sample study of 2005, the proportion of out of school children is reported to have dropped from 6.94% to 3.5%. This overall drop is also reflected in decline in the out of school children in various social categories. It appears that with redoubled efforts in the states where there are large numbers of out of school children, this number should go down further. That it has not gone down for over a year is probably linked with the lag in school construction, non-availability of upper primary schools in vicinity and severe social issues related to the various social categories.
- 5.1.3 The real last mile problems regarding out of school children may be in locations where schools cannot be constructed (forests to concentrated urban slums) and also children who live on the streets, on railway platforms, in observation homes, and are engaged in bonded labor in cities and rural areas. Most of these children are often invisible to door to door and even sample surveys. Planned, sustained, concerted efforts of various governmental agencies in partnership with NGOs will be required to deal with this issue that involves various laws regarding children. **The mission recommends specific planning and child tracking for all such categories in focused manner especially in and around urban areas.**
- 5.1.4 Results of student attendance survey, which also incidentally provided teacher attendance in different states, are a matter of great concern. The student attendance in the most populous Bihar and UP is particularly low at about 40% and 60% respectively. In many states the attendance figures are close to 90% or higher. Out of the 17 states reported, two have attendance higher than 90%, six are between 80-90%, four are between 70-80%, three between 60-70% and two between 40-60%. By and large the attendance in upper primary schools is not too different from attendance in primary schools, especially in states where attendance is near or above 90%. In Rajasthan the upper primary attendance is 16 percentage points higher at 78.9% and in complete contrast in Punjab the upper primary attendance is lower than in primary by 7% points at 74.7%.

**Student attendance rates have to be improved in states that are lagging behind in this respect.**

- 5.1.5 The student attendance study is a very positive step and it has shown low attendance in many states. This effort has to deepen. One of the criticisms about high enrollment data is often that while children's names are recorded on the register, many students actually do not show up. Another point that often comes up in discussions is related to dual enrollment of students in government schools for benefits such as uniforms, text books, mid-day meals, and private schools for learning. These impressions have to be cleared. **The mission recommends that states take a closer look at children absence data to gain insight into such issues.**
- 5.1.6 **The Mission also recommends data on attendance of children be captured by states and validated by sample studies on a regular basis.**
- 5.1.7 Teacher attendance shows two states above 90%, nine between 80-90%, seven in 70-80. . In states such as Kerala, where student attendance is 91%, the 84% teachers attend. In contrast, teacher attendance in Bihar and UP is around 75-79%, as opposed to the student attendance between 40 and 60%. It is interesting that upper primary teacher attendance in Assam is at 50% while the student attendance is 84.5%. In Gujarat, the teacher attendance is 70% at primary and 87.6% in upper primary. In several states the teacher attendance need to be improved. More important is what the teachers do in school. **Teacher attendance is an essential factor for improvement in quality of education.**
- 5.1.8 There appears to be no major difference in boy vs girl attendance in the first half of the day even in states such as Bihar and Rajasthan which have major gender parity problems. Similarly, SC attendance is not too different from the general attendance rates. In some states ST and minority attendance is low, but these are also states that have generally low attendance and overall issues of enrollment and school functioning. What are the lessons to be drawn from this? Clearly, where attendance is high, it is high for all and where it is low, it is low for all. The school attendance is apparently not a function of social backwardness or disadvantage. It must be dependent on other factors such as habit formation, school functioning, and so on. **It is important to closely study factors that impact student attendance.**

## 6. Infrastructure:

6.1 One of the most significant achievements of SSA has been the construction of a vast number of new school buildings and classrooms. The latest estimate, as on March 31, 2007 is that 6.94 lakh classrooms, based on the SSA norms. Most States are on track to perhaps complete this task by as early as 2008-09, with the exception of Bihar, West Bengal, Jharkhand Madhya Pradesh, and UP. But it is expected that by 2010, all States will have completed this task. This would be indeed an extraordinary achievement to provide a school or a learning center for over 170 million children in the elementary school-going age-group, 6-14 years. However, the Mission noted that the completion rate of civil works stands at 67% and with in progress it is 91%. If the targets are to be reached by 2010, the completion rates in some states will have to be improved with better planning and management.

6.2 The 5<sup>th</sup> JRM has highlighted the importance of school design, and the environments created within and outside the classroom, to promote learning. A significant achievement has been the variety of State initiatives including the use of functional and context-specific features, child-friendly elements as well as enabling elements for handicapped students.

6.3 The Ministry has taken several steps such as allowing up to 50% of allocation to the districts that have major gaps. In some states, such as Delhi and Bihar, availability of land for school construction is a major problem. In other states, due to forest land, building schools is nearly impossible under the current set up. **The Government of India needs to take up issues related to land for schools in forest areas.**

6.4 Some states have reported some resolute steps in the direction of timely implementation and quality civil construction. Planning funds flow and construction timelines together with involvement of senior officers in monitoring quality of construction is something that could be replicated particularly by states that lag behind on completion of civil works. The states with large civil works should be particularly careful to enforce better planning measures to that advances are adjusted in a timely manner.

6.5 The Mission is informed that there is a gap of 15,000 drinking water facilities and 62,000 toilets currently. Lack of toilets is one of the key problems associated with

girls' education and functioning of female teachers in rural schools. **The Mission recommends the provision of toilets and drinking water facilities in all schools on a priority basis.**

6.6 SSA is a central intervention designed to give boost to the efforts of universal elementary education. Over a period of time, the gains of SSA have to be mainstreamed into the state systems and the states will need to continue to improve all round quality of schools, schooling, and outcomes. In order to promote a conducive environment for learning, a set of minimum school and classroom facilities must be provided to every child. In addition to teachers and adequate - size classrooms, this list could include drinking water, toilets, boundary wall, textbooks, etc. Every State should define its standards. **The Mission recommends that every state should on a priority basis begin the exercise of defining these standards for every school in conformity with SSA norms, a time-table for completion of this task, and set in place a system to track progress towards universal coverage.**

6.7 Ramps have been constructed in over half of all schools- over 500,000 schools - in an attempt to make schools barrier free but the quality of ramp construction including the quality of the surface and the angle of the ramp remain a question mark. **SSA should reinforce guidelines for construction of ramps as per technical specifications.**

## **7. Equity Issues:**

**7.1 Gender:** The gender gap at the primary stage for children 6-10 stands at about 4.6% after adjustment for the actual state-wise proportion of girls in population. At the upper primary stage the gender gap is greater and stands at a national average of 8%. The biggest contributors to this gap are Bihar and Rajasthan. Twenty-nine states at the primary level and, twenty three at the upper primary level are reported to have achieved gender parity. Twenty nine States at the primary level and sixteen States at the upper primary level have a GPI of => 0.9.

7.1.1 There is no question that due to multiple factors, many of them subjective, the environment has changed in favor of girls' education in a big way. It is particularly noteworthy that the attendance figures of girls are no different from the boys', which is a stronger indicator than enrollment alone. The approach of SSA using

targeted funding at districts, and blocks which have high gender disparity is a step in the right direction. **These districts will have to be watched carefully.**

7.1.2 The NPEGEL and KGBV interventions are important signals for greater participation of girls in schooling. The convergence with ICDS to ensure that ICDS centers are located inside or in close proximity of the school is also a continuing important factor. Proportion of female teachers has risen gradually from 36.3% in 2002-03 to 40.3% in 2005-06 and hopefully rising further. It is not clear if the proportion of female teachers is also high in the districts with low gender parity. These are typically districts with low female literacy and backward in many respects including social backwardness. **Special efforts will have to be made to ensure female teachers are deployed in these districts.** Although the proportion of female teachers is increasing steadily, many states, especially (Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh, Uttarakhand, Himachal Pradesh & Haryana have 21-33% female teachers. The proportion in rural areas, especially in backward districts is bound to be much lower.

7.1.3 KGBV is clearly going to be a very important and major intervention in years to come. **A special consultation to strengthen quality and education in KGBV is required. KGBV appears to be one area where corporate and other donors can make a significant contribution technically and financially. This needs to be explored.**

## 7.2 SC/ ST:

7.2.1 The enrollment trends among SC/ST children are reported to be encouraging with halving of out of school children since 2005. The bureau has compared projections based on IMRB-SRI survey in 2005 with the door to door census data available from the states in 2006-07. **Another sample survey of the kind conducted in 2005 that is planned in 2008 may be useful to validate the encouraging decline in all out of school children including the SC/ST and the minorities**

7.2.2 Different departments responsible for tribal development are running Ashram shalas and such residential schools. In some states the coordination between SSA and these departments is quite good. It needs to be strengthened in other states so that the quality of all educational institutions for the tribals improves.

- 7.2.3 The proportion of SC/ST children enrolled in schools exceeds their proportion in the population. As against the national average proportion of 16.2% of SC and 8.2% of ST, their respective share in all schools is 20.4% and 11.4% respectively. In Punjab, where the proportion of SC in population is 28.9%, the schools report a proportion of 47% SC. Clearly improving schools in Punjab is a very direct matter of social equity. **In Haryana and UP, where private schooling is increasing, the government schools have a very high proportion of SC students of 31 % and 28%, respectively.**
- 7.2.4 The states have adopted a variety of innovative schemes to address the issues related to SC/ST children. These include residential schools, remedial learning, and special focused education centers for English, Science etc. Targeted funding for districts and blocks with high proportion of SC and/or ST population is probably proving useful in ensuring proper focus on the issues related to these social categories.

### 7.3 Minorities:

- 7.3.1 Targeted approach in case of educationally backward religious minorities, mainly Muslims, has been adopted. It is too early to expect full results from the various strategies in place but reports indicate that the out of school children numbers among minorities are declining along with the general population and in 24 States for which comparable data is available, out of school children have declined to 6.16% (2007) from 10.8% (IMRB 2005). Out of an estimated total of 2.2 million out of school children in 2005, 1.8 million were in UP (0.78 m,) Bihar (0.62 m) and West Bengal (0.39 m) and Assam (0.08 m).
- 7.3.2 The highest decline in out of school children, and probably the single largest contribution is observed in UP where the numbers are reported to have dropped by 0.6 million followed by a drop of 0.2 million in Bihar.
- 7.3.3 Encouraging Madarsas and Maqtabas to adopt mainstream curricula and assisting with provision of training, teachers, TLM grants etc is an important strategy that seems to have had a major effect in UP.
- 7.3.4 Attendance rates of minority students in schools are about the same as the general rates. In fact, in several states, the attendance rates of minority students are marginally higher than for the overall rates (MP, UP, Rajasthan-UPS).

7.3.5 KGBV schools have been sanctioned in 266 educationally backward blocks having over 20 per cent Muslim population, of which 92 have become operational until now. Further, the available data indicate that the proportion of Muslim girls in these 92 schools is about 24%, which is commendable.

#### 7.4 Children with Special Needs

7.4.1 The number of CWSN identified has been increasing steadily indicating deepening efforts. With nearly 2.4 million children identified, the proportion of identified children is at about 1.21% as against a census proportion that is about 2.3%. **The mission recommends continued wider efforts to identify CWSN.**

7.4.2 The three pronged approach used – mainstreaming in regular schools, AIE centers, and home-based learning for severely disabled, - should be continued.

7.4.3 The number of NGOs participating in IE programs is increasing. It is observed that coverage of children with orthopedic disability is the highest whereas those with severe visual impairment and mental challenges are the hardest to cover. **Given the special needs of these categories, the SSA may do well to design special interventions based on experiences available**

#### 7.5 EGS and AIE

7.5.1 The continuing decline in numbers of EGS centers and simultaneous up-gradation of these centers with high achievement rates to regular primary schools is consistent with the bridging nature of these centers. Even in small habitations, it should be possible to create satellite school systems with all children on the roll of a larger school and support from such schools to the schools in hamlets.

7.5.2 The experience of the AIE centers seems to be mixed. Though the coverage under AIE has increased from 17 lac in March 2005-06 to 28 lakh in March 2006-07 overall achievement rate for AIE centers is about 50% with AIE interventions underperforming in nine states. **This implies lack of proper planning and implementation of the AIE schemes in these states. The mission recommends a thorough review of underperformance in these states and fine tuning of planning and approval procedures for projects under AIE.**

7.5.3 The bureau has correctly identified the challenges and the thrust areas for AIE. These are –seasonal migration, child labor, and urban deprived children. **SSA has issued guidelines that will make AIE effective for the children belonging to these thrust areas.**

## 8 Quality

### 8.1 Student learning

8.1.1 There are several sources of evidence on learning levels in primary education – NCERT tests, some states' own tests etc. These suggest that primary school learning achievement is lamentably low (Appendix 2). For instance, in Tamil Nadu government's tests of 2.07 lakh Std 5 students, mean marks in maths, English and Tamil were 34%, 40% and 63% respectively. Learning levels at upper primary stage are very poor too: in NCERT national tests in classes VII and VIII, mean maths test scores were 29.9% and 38.5% respectively and mean science test scores were 36.0% and 40.5% respectively.

8.1.2 As well as low achievement, there is great variability in learning levels according to NCERT learning surveys. For instance, class III mean achievement in maths was 58.25% with a standard deviation of 24.89.

8.1.3 There are encouraging indications that such action is beginning to happen. Learning assessments have been undertaken in many states, though they are not yet systematized. Many states have moved from micro level pilot programs to macro level scaled-up programs. **Several states have remedial programs to enhance learning such as the 3 R's Guarantee Program in Maharashtra, GAP in Gujarat, CLIP and CLAPS in Andhra, ILEP in West Bengal, Bidya Jyoti in Assam, KSQAO / KSQE in Karnataka, ABL in Tamil Nadu, QICK in Kerala, PLEP in Punjab, Nai Disha in UP, Neev in Uttarakhand and LAP in Rajasthan. NCERT too has prepared national guidelines for the competencies that a Std III child is expected to achieve.**

8.1.4 However, problems remain which deserve serious attention. While NCERT's baseline, midterm and final tests on a sample basis are valuable, the existing school system of periodic testing of cognitive skills in all schools needs to be improved. Some states have conducted tests of learning levels on adhoc basis.

The experience from these could be helpful in evolving more regular and reliable system of student assessment

- 8.1.5 The need to evaluate or assess children's learning has three interconnected but independent aspects. First of all the teacher needs to know where each child stands so that she/he can appropriately help the child. Secondly, it is important for the parents to know what the child is expected to know/ learn and if the child is learning. This can help the parent assist the child -it is also a measure for accountability of the school/ teacher to the child and the parent. Finally, student assessment on sample basis is also needed so that the administrators can monitor the overall situation on periodic basis.
- 8.1.6 Continuous Comprehensive Evaluation, in its truest sense, requires the teacher to be sensitive to the level and need of every child. However, it cannot substitute a periodic assessment of the child at least in the foreseeable future. But, it is also true that the assessment should not be only knowledge or text-book based, in order to discourage rote learning. Hence, a basic framework of simplified goals of learning of basic skills needs to be created for every standard with some scientific research. **This can take time but in the interim, each state can create such frameworks based on their current syllabus expectations.**
- 8.1.7 Once such a framework is created, it can become the basis of the first stages of continuous evaluation by teachers, accountability to parents, and periodic sample assessment by administrative bodies. Such frameworks have been created with different degrees of finesse in several states, including Andhra Pradesh (CLIP and CLAPS), TN, Karnataka, MP, UP and so on.
- 8.1.8 We have two related recommendations. **Firstly, it is necessary to create simplified and clearly measurable learning goals which the teacher can continuously assess and report to the parent in an understandable manner. Secondly, continuous evaluation including periodic assessment of the children based on these goals should be conducted.**

## 8.2 Improving English Learning

- 8.2.1 Though almost all States have now introduced English in Std. 1 or Std. 3, there is a need for greater understanding of what and how students should be taught and

levels of English learning. Mission is informed that such a study has been entrusted to NCERT.

### 8.2.2 Initiatives in Tribal Education

- Under SSA, many new initiatives have taken place and among the lead States in this area, apart from the North Eastern States, are Andhra Pradesh, Orissa, Chhattisgarh and Gujarat. Andhra Pradesh has developed primers and supplementary readers in 8 tribal languages for the early primary years. This project has been introduced in 1000 schools, and is planned to be scaled up. Orissa has focused on the issue of attitudes towards tribals and tribal culture, as part of its in-service training programs for teachers. Using a cluster based approach has initiated a celebration of tribal festivals and culture in 200 schools involving the local community.
- **The Mission records its appreciation of these initiatives,**

### 8.3 Teachers

- 8.3.1 The quality of learning depends in very large measure on teachers, the critical agent in education. If teachers are locally accountable, competent to deliver the curriculum, and spend adequate time on task, their students' learning outcomes are likely to be significantly better than if these conditions are lacking.
- 8.3.2 The regularity of teacher attendance is a sine qua non of pupil attendance and without pupils attending on a regular basis there is no learning. MHRD has conducted a study of teacher attendance rates in 2006 which shows an average national teacher attendance rate of 80%. MHRD's target is to increase teacher attendance to 90% by the year 2009-10 when it will repeat its teacher attendance study. This is clearly attention in the right direction. **It is recommended that states far from the target on teacher attendance rates delineate the concrete measures they will take to reduce teacher absence rates.**
- 8.3.3 SSA has taken steps to improve teacher accountability including specific directions given in the PAB for 2007-08, where it is made conditional with the states that teacher accountability systems should be examined and redesigned (a) to link teacher advancement with performance including levels of student achievements (b) responsibilities towards the community in respect of learning

levels of their wards from a school performance and their regularity of their attendance. **The mission recommends that this direction to improve upon teacher performance should be persisted with in order to ensure better outcomes.**

8.3.4 Time on task: It is reassuring to note that teachers' and students' time on task is receiving attention, as reflected in the on-going 'Time on Task Study' commissioned by MHRD whose TOR were shared with Mission members.

#### 8.4 **Pupil teacher ratios as per DISE 2005-06:**

8.4.1 The overall pupil teacher ratio is 41:1 in primary and 29:1 in upper primary classes. While these seem satisfactory, the averages mask great interstate and inter-district variation. States with high PTRs at primary are Bihar (73:1), Uttar Pradesh (60:1), Jharkhand (53:1) and West Bengal (47:1). A total of 83 districts, or about 15% of all districts, had PTRs greater than 60. Those with primary PTRs greater than 100 in 2005-06 are Bhojpur, Buxar, Purnia, Saran and Sheikhpura in Bihar, South Delhi, Bangalore in Karnataka and Kushinagar in Uttar Pradesh.

8.4.2 The existence of extremely high PTRs in some areas suggests much unevenness in the distribution of teachers and raises the issue of teacher recruitment and teacher deployment in the more remote areas. As of now, states which have to recruit more than 15,000 teachers under SSA are: West Bengal (39,486); Rajasthan (33,057); Bihar (29,218), Jharkhand (18480) and Orissa (16486). The states reported that they have started using DISE data to redeploy and rationalize teacher deployment.

#### 8.5 **Other quality related issues:**

8.5.1 Class time table: One of the barest minimum requirements of good class-room practice is that there should be a weekly or daily class time table. This should show which subject is taught to the class in which time slot during each day, allowing realistic time for the mid-day meal break. **It is recommended that all elementary schools should prominently display the daily class time-table by class and each student should have a copy of it so that parents are also aware.**

8.5.2 Basic facilities: **DISE should capture the level of the functionality of the blackboards available in the school and number of reading materials available for children.**

8.5.3 Overall classroom facilities: At present, the expenditure on teaching learning materials forms a small portion of the recurring education budget which has a very high (97%) salary component. The 11<sup>th</sup> Plan Working Group on education has recommended substantial increases in materials to be provided in the classroom. There is a need to begin create list of optimum classroom facilities and effective teaching aids in a relatively resource rich classroom in India over then next three years as more and more resources become available. Tamil Nadu ABL program is an example in raising the classroom processes and classroom materials within SSA financing structure in a child centric manner.

8.5.4 **It is recommended that children’s learning achievements and other aspects of their continuous and comprehensive evaluation be recorded in an annual Report Card.**

## 8.6 **Teacher Training and Student Learning**

8.6.1 Any significant improvement in teaching and learning in our classrooms requires an equally significant improvement in the quality of in-service training programmes that SSA is presently providing to our teachers. The magnitude of this task cannot be underestimated. Annually, 20-25 lakhs of teachers receive 10-20 days of in-service training. However, as the Fifth Review Mission has observed, “the impact of training is not very visible where to a large extent the traditional teaching methods were observed”. In this context, the 4<sup>th</sup> JRM recommended that an evaluation study be commissioned on the impact of in-service teacher training on classroom processes. The Mission has been informed that this study will be completed by April, 2008.

8.6.2 Given the SSA goal of significantly improving the quality of learning in the classroom, the Mission acknowledges that the SSA has set itself along the following directions:

- Every State needs to develop a long-term training agenda which gives a vision and specific directions to annual training programmes.

- Adopt a cafeteria approach where teachers opt for the training they need rather than attend all training programmes.
- About 3/4 of all primary schools have 3 or less teachers, and about one-third of all primary schools have less than 60 students spread over 4-5 classes. Training programmes should provide comprehensive guidelines for teachers on how to maximize learning in multi-Std classrooms.
- Students come from a variety of backgrounds, predominantly socially and economically disadvantaged backgrounds. Based on local conditions, issues such as children's home language and cultural background, and discrimination of girls, SCs and STs need to be addressed during training.
- Aspects of teacher competence at the upper primary level in subjects such as English, Mathematics and Science.

### 8.6.3 Training of Untrained Teachers

8.6.3.1 Given the current backlog of untrained teachers (around 3 lacs), as well as large-scale recruitment of new teachers, the Mission recommends that:

- **IGNOU's distance education courses for training of untrained teachers should be evaluated for their effectiveness.**

### 8.7 Teacher Support Institutions : BRCs and CRCs

8.7.1 If significant improvement in student learning has to take place, teachers would require extensive academic support including guidance in the classroom. The primary goal of the BRC and CRCs is to provide just this type of academic supervision and guidance. The performance of this extensive network of over 7000 BRCs, 6600 CRCs and over 1 lakh resource persons is being studied by SSA.

### 8.8 Teacher Competence

8.8.1 Two critical and inter-related aspects of teacher competence are teacher knowledge of subject matter, and actual teacher performance in classrooms.

8.8.1.1 **Teachers should be provided intensive in-service training to help them acquire these subject matter skills and knowledge.**

## 8.8.2 Teacher Performance in Classrooms

8.8.2.1 A universal concern of all involved in education is how to improve teacher performance in the classrooms. This is of particular concern to SSA, as its main goal is improving children's learning. Furthermore it has allocated considerable funds towards building of academic structures like BRCs and CRCs to provide academic support and guidance to teachers. In-service training of teachers on a regular basis, and teacher grants, has also become an institutionalized feature of SSA.

8.8.2.2 At present, we do not have any direct measures for assessing teacher performance, or for directing inputs towards desired improvements in classroom performance. ADEPTS – a collaborative project of MHRD and UNICEF – is an attempt to address these two related issues - to improve what teachers actually do in classrooms, and to enable CRCs, BRCs and DIETs to improve teacher performance. The Mission views ADEPTS as an important measure to improve teacher competence in the classroom, which will benefit both SSA and the system as a whole. **The Mission recommends that ADEPTS should receive whatever support is required by MHRD and State educational authorities to complete its task.**

## 9 Monitoring systems and data: Quality and usage

9.1 DISE provides a unique data collection channel and provides very timely data on education which can facilitate local planning and the targeting of resources. **We have several recommendations on monitoring systems of SSA:**

- (a) DISE data is taken as the national annual official education statistics. NUEPA is, and should continue to be, the agency that collects all required data for DISE
- (b) Steps should be taken to reduce unnecessary data collection and burdensome form-filling by determining what is the minimum amount of data required from schools, with what frequency and by which agency/agencies.
- (c) A study should be carried out of the correspondence between findings from DISE data and from the 5% cross-check of DISE.

- (d) Use of DISE data for planning: DISE data should be used at the block level to identify areas for school improvement. That is, DISE data should be used for local level education planning. Each state should produce its own analytical report on elementary education, based on DISE data, with district-wise (and possibly block-wise) information on important parameters. Himachal Pradesh has produced such a report and has also produced a small pocket book with key education information and given that to each school. Himachal Pradesh's example in this respect is worthy of emulation:
- (e) NSSO is conducting 64<sup>th</sup> round on 'participation in education' as it did in 1995-96.

## 9.2 **Financial Management:**

9.2.1 **Manual:** The Financial Management and Procurement manual has been translated in Hindi and many other languages. To facilitate better understanding at the grass-root level, states have shared the manual at all the required levels. It is a simple but logical step to instill financial discipline at all the levels. *All states have developed VEC manual in simplified form and local language.*

### 9.2.2 **Staffing**

(a) **Position:** The states appear to be progressing well as most of them have recruited accounting staff at SPO and district levels barring a few vacancies. However, it is felt that in order to augment the work further and to closely monitor the efficacy of financial management at BRC/CRC/VEC levels, the States may appoint account personnel if the same could be managed within their management costs.

(b) **Training:** Training in the area of financial management needs attention by most of the states/UTs. At SPO level the basic accounting skills are satisfactory. In some of the districts (as reported in the Audit reports) double entry system is not followed which the States must address. The States will have to strengthen the accounts keeping below district levels by augmenting capacity building measures such as incorporating selected components of accounts information in the in-service periodic training of teachers,.

9.2.3 **Disbursement of Funds:** The Mission Members welcome the GoI decision to release 25% of budget in the first month of the financial year as this must facilitate timely use of funds. The schools would now be able to ensure preparatory work like maintenance, civil work during summers only.

- Some of the more systemic issues like streamlining the flow of funds are being addressed, though it is possible that the flow from the national to the state level may be easier than the within state flows.
- Electronic transfer of funds/ use of credit advice facilities at nationalized or scheduled banks are being encouraged. Web based banking is futuristic. Andhra Pradesh's experiment of Web banking with Canara Bank is a positive and timely initiative. Other States must encourage web based banking that not only economise time and money but also facilitate transparency and feedbacks at all levels. The responsibility and accountability of disbursement will also be shared and strengthened with such organized efforts. Other states to adopt this model by liaising with Banks which have sound network of branches in their States and also e-transfer facilities.
- UP and Orissa (partially) have implemented E-transfers at the sub-district level, while most of other states (Chhattisgarh, Gujarat, Haryana, Karnataka and Rajasthan) have implemented at the district level, subject to the availability of the facilities. Other States should do the same with their Bankers with context specific strategies.

9.2.4 **Bank reconciliation:** The monthly bank reconciliation except in few states like Himachal Pradesh, Andhra Pradesh, Pondicherry, Chhattisgarh and Jharkhand are regular. It is good to note that when compared to last year the number of states reporting lack of Bank Reconciliation has decreased significantly.

9.2.5 **Procurement provisions:** There is need for additional training to offices involved in procurement on the provisions of the manual and its strict implementation, on the differences between practices and the manual's provisions (Assam, Uttaranchal, Madhya Pradesh, Jharkhand, Kerala, Maharashtra). In particular, the issues of negotiations with bidders and publicity of bid need emphasis.

- 9.2.6 **VEC Manual:** The Mission was informed that most of the States have developed VEC manual in the local language and have circulated these to the VEC.
- 9.2.7 **Submission & Mechanisms of statutory audit reports:** Most of the states / UTs have submitted their Statutory Audit Reports. Discussions on auditor selection process revealed that the process is transparent and selection criteria give due consideration to quality as well as cost.
- 9.2.8 **Utilization Certificates:** In few cases auditors report non-availability of utilization certificates and non settlement of Advances at VEC level. It is suggested that in case utilization certificates are not available at different levels, these should be treated as advances and need to tracked properly as specified in the Manual on Financial Management and Procurement.
- 9.2.9 **Compliance Report:** 16 States/UTs have provided compliance report for the audit observations for the year 2005-06. The remaining states which have reported irregularities should also provide audit compliance report. GoI has instituted independent audit of SSA account where it was deemed fit. This should be continued in future also.
- 9.2.10 **Internal audit mechanism:** Internal audit system (para 100 of FMP Manual) is in place in most of the states. However, Internal Audit continues to be weak in many states. Since, the overall program size has been increasing significantly and consistently, internal audit needs attention and strengthening. Either, the model used by Gujarat (appointment of firms of Chartered Accountants) be used or states may appoint/depute their own staff (Uttar Pradesh) or use a combination of both.
- 9.2.11 **Transparency at Various LEVELS:** There are provisions in SSA to display updated information on receipts and expenditure by a school. This provision needs to re-emphasized to ensure social accounting.
- 9.3 **Financial progress and expenditure patterns**
- 9.3.1 **Levels of spending:** It is welcome sign that most of the states and SSA have increased their level of spending and investment on elementary education. (Table I)

**Table I**  
**Time Series Trend since 2001-02 on % increase over previous year for Budget approved, Releases and Expenditure**

| Year    | AWP&B   | GOI releases | State Releases | Total Funds available | Expenditure |
|---------|---------|--------------|----------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| 2002-03 | 227.47% | 223.88%      | 518.95%        | 327.31%               | 658.92%     |
| 2003-04 | 134.21% | 76.49%       | 118.16%        | 106.30%               | 134.17%     |
| 2004-05 | 28.76%  | 86.97%       | 95.59%         | 65.01%                | 115.81%     |
| 2005-06 | 29.51%  | 48.72%       | 90.91%         | 72.43%                | 51.59%      |
| 2006-07 | 46.03%  | 50.21%       | 20.20%         | 32.13%                | 52.75%      |

Table I clearly reflects upon increasing commitment of GoI as well as state government.

Not only approvals have an increasing trend but also the actual releases of GoI as well as state government have largely increased. States on average seem to have developed absorption capacity and the expenditures also register consistent growth.

9.3.2 Barring few states mentioned below all have performed well on macro level. However, certain state specific interventions are still required including unspent balances in absolute terms and percentage utilization of funds available. The GoI must address these issues at the earliest. (Table II)

**Table II**  
**Quantum of unspent balance as on March 2007**

| States        | Funds Available | Unspent Balance | Adjusted Unspent Balance* |
|---------------|-----------------|-----------------|---------------------------|
| Uttar Pradesh | 313582.00       | 48201.00        | 35027.97                  |
| Assam         | 74640.72        | 32251.02        | 16602.33                  |
| Maharashtra   | 94300.49        | 16185.42        | 10541.55                  |

\*Unspent balance adjusted against excess share released by states.

The states shown in the table have unspent balances more than 10% of the fund available during the year. Tying up of such large sums of government money should be avoided as far as possible and states should be advised accordingly. (Table III)

### 9.3.3 Low Performing States for 2006-07

**Table III**  
**% Utilisation of the funds available**

| States      | 2003-04 | 2004-05 | 2005-06 | 2006-07 |
|-------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| Lakshadweep | 0.00    | 0.00    | 27.41   | 6.29    |
| Nagaland    | 76.05   | 87.17   | 7.01    | 7.01    |
| Daman &Diu  | 0.00    | 0.00    | 22.04   | 11.02   |
| Assam       | 86.64   | 80.72   | 71.08   | 56.79   |
| Pondicherry | 69.39   | 54.36   | 53.57   | 62.59   |

It may also be noted that above listed states have not been able to perform significantly when compared to total funds available with the state. The utilization rate of first three states namely Lakshadweep, Nagaland and Daman & Diu is so low that it requires immediate attention and must pickup fast so as to achieve the desired project targets. Assam also needs particular attention as the expenditure against available funds has a consistent declining trend.

9.4 **Physical Verification of assets:** SSA proposed Evaluation of Environmental Management Practices through third-party evaluations of the physical infrastructure constructed/created under the program. Many states do not maintain Fixed Assets Register, one of the most basic document indicating availability of physical assets, number, location & condition etc. Absence of the registers inhibits tracing and possible effective use of these instruments.

#### **Major Recommendations**

1. **This is the first year of the 11<sup>th</sup> Plan and a major change has been made in the funding pattern of the SSA from 75:25 to 50:50 from the year 2007-08. This has posed a major issue of whether states will be able to provide the substantially higher resources from last year's 3,700 crores to 10,000 crores, that being the SSA GOI provision for 2007-08. From the information provided, we understand that the states have committed Rs. 5000 crore in their AWP&B. This will permit the GOI to release only Rs. 5000 crores out of the Rs. 10,000 allocated. MHRD has to resolve this issue to ensure that the pace and tempo of the project and the activities at the state level does not slacken or suffer on account of this decision.**
2. **All states should articulate a long term plan for improvement in quality of learning, including a training agenda for all their teachers focusing on improving**

classroom processes and children's learning. The strengthening of CRCs, BRCs, as teacher support institutions, is critical to the success of this endeavor.

3. The Mission recommends that all states set standards of knowledge and skills in subject matter that teachers are expected to acquire. All states should also provide intensive in-service training to help teachers acquire skills and knowledge.
4. It is necessary to create simplified and clearly measurable learning goals which the teacher can continuously assess and report to the parent in an understandable manner. Secondly, continuous evaluation including periodic assessment of the children based on these goals should be conducted.
5. We have a number of recommendations on education data: (a) that steps be taken to reduce unnecessary data collection and burdensome form-filling by determining what is the minimum amount of data required from schools and with what frequency (b) that DISE data is taken as the national annual official education statistics. It is also recommended that a study be carried out on the correspondence between findings from DISE data and from the 5% cross-check of DISE.
6. A national mean teacher absence rate of 20% is high and it is good that MHRD have set a goal of 90% attendance rate (i.e. a 10% absence rate) by 2009-10. MHRD's study of teacher absence should seek to discover the factors behind teacher absence and suggest concrete steps that will be taken to reduce absence rates.
7. The state SSA structures should ensure that they function in cohesion and convergence with mainstream education department structures so that the benefits of the program especially in planning and implementation are fully sustained after the program as well. We recommend that the study be conducted to assess the status of efforts to involve the mainstream education department structures in SSA planning and implementation processes.
8. Increased participation of Muslims in mainstream education necessarily requires more inclusive and focused interventions.
9. Internal audits need to be strengthened based on clues from statutory audit reports. Training to be provided at all levels specially to sub-district/VEC level. The states should also be encouraged to switch to web-banking to make the funds flow more transparent and quick.

**Sixth Review Mission of SSA -July, 2007  
Terms of Reference (TOR)**

**INTRODUCTION**

Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), a programme for attaining the goal of Universal Elementary Education in the Country, has been launched in 2001-02. This comprehensive programme of Government of India, launched in partnership with the state Governments, aims to provide useful and relevant education to all children in the 6-14 age group by 2010. The programme is characterized by context specific planning and a process based, time bound implementation strategy. This is an attempt to improve quality of education through decentralized and context specific planning.

The development objective of the programme, aligned with the SSA goals, are as follows:

- (i) All children in school, Education Guarantee Centre, Alternate School, 'Back-to-School' camp by 2005.
- (ii) Focus on elementary education of satisfactory quality with emphasis on education for life.
- (iii) Bridge all gender and social category gaps at primary state by 2007 and at elementary education level by 2010.
- (iv) Universal retention by 2010.

**MISSION OBJECTIVES**

The 6<sup>th</sup> RM would carry out a comprehensive review of information received on :

- (i) Annual progress on agreed indicators in terms of compiled EMIS data and other data sources;
- (ii) Results of assessment of learning achievements, if due;
- (iii) GOI budget allocations for SSA and State/SSA expenditures;
- (iv) Issues related to state and district implementation capacity and agree on actions taken to support weaker states;
- (v) Review of financial management related issues.
- (vi) Report on Research Studies undertaken.

## GUIDING PRINCIPLE OF THE REVIEW

The Mission's concept is one of a Learning Mission: (a) learning of progress made against agreed indicators, as well as (b) cross sharing of experience that highlight strengths and weaknesses with a view to strengthen implementation capacities.

## MISSION PLAN

The Mission would comprise 6 members to be nominated by GOI including a Financial Management & Procurement specialist. The Mission Leader among the 6 members will be identified by GOI.

Mission members familiar with the SSA programme would be selected. The methodology of finalizing the Mission report/aide-memoire will be decided by the Mission members.

Three thematic discussions in which GOI, States SPDs, some coordinators from the States will participate would be organized as part of the Mission.

## TIME FRAME

The JRM would take place between July 16<sup>th</sup> (Monday) to July 26<sup>th</sup> (Thursday) 2007 as follows:

| <b>Date / Day</b>                       | <b>Activity</b>   |
|---|---|
| 16 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Monday)    | GOI briefing to Mission members   |
| 17 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Tuesday)   | Mission work, including analysis of documents by Mission team.                          |
| 18 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Wednesday) | Thematic discussion I – Quality   |
| 19 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Thursday)  | Thematic discussion II – Closing the Gaps (Infrastructure/Outcomes/Special Focus Group) |
| 20 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Friday)    | Thematic discussion III – Financial Management  |
| 21 <sup>st</sup> July, 2007 (Saturday)  | Writing of Report / Aide Memoire  |
| 22 <sup>nd</sup> July, 2007 (Sunday)    |   |
| 23 <sup>rd</sup> July, 2007 (Monday)    |   |
| 24 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Tuesday)   | Pre-wrap-up   |
| 25 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Wednesday) | Reflections on Aide-Memoire and finalisation of Report                                  |
| 26 <sup>th</sup> July, 2007 (Thursday)  | Wrap up / Report presentation to GOI  |

## **DOCUMENTS AND INFORMATION REQUIRED**

Information to be provided by GOI:

1. GOI budget allocations for SSA for 2007-08 and releases.
2. Expenditure Reports 2006-07.
3. Audit compliance reports from States/ UT's/ National component for the period 2005-06.
4. Report on annual progress on Agreed Performance/Monitoring/ Indicators. **Annex-I.**
5. State/ UT wise reports on annual progress on monitoring indicators. **Annex-II & Annex-III.**
6. Overall Program Implementation Report of States/ UT's/ National Component - **Annex-IV. (States/UT's)**
7. Minutes of PAB 2007-08.

### **Composition of the Mission**

The Mission consists of 6 members including the leader, who were all nominated by the Government of India. They are:

Kumud Bansal (Mission Leader)  
Madhav Chavan  
Geeta Gandhi Kingdon  
John Kurrien  
Santosh Mehrotra  
Imraan Saleem

**Table 1: Achievement test results for Standard V, Tamil Nadu**

| Source                | Tamil | Maths | English |
|-----------------------|-------|-------|---------|
| TN SPD (all children) | 63.0  | 34.0  | 40.0    |
| (male children)       | 60.0  | 33.0  | 37.0    |
| (female children)     | 67.0  | 34.0  | 43.0    |
| NCERT                 | 71.1  | 58.4  | ---     |
| Districts             |       |       |         |
| Villupuram – TN SPD   | 59.7  | 36.1  | 38.7    |
| Cuddalore – TN SPD    | 57.3  | 25.4  | 30.4    |

Source: Tamil Nadu presentation to the Review Mission. The tests were carried out in 2006 in 5768 schools in 412 blocks and 2,07,000 children of Grade V were tested by Block Resource Teacher Educators under District Programme Coordinators' guidance. TN SPD is Tamil Nadu State Project Directorate.

**Table 2: Achievement test results, Uttar Pradesh  
Nai Disha: UP Government Testing Data for 20 districts**

|                   | STD 1    |        |       |        | STD 2    |        |       |         |
|-------------------|----------|--------|-------|--------|----------|--------|-------|---------|
|                   | Baseline |        | Final |        | Baseline |        | Final |         |
| ARITHMETIC        | %        | N      | %     | N      | %        | N      | %     | N       |
| Subtraction       | 0.8      |        | 8.6   |        | 4.0      |        | 19.8  |         |
| Addition          | 2.5      |        | 15.7  |        | 9.4      |        | 22.2  |         |
| Num recog. 21-100 | 24.4     |        | 37.1  |        | 28.1     |        | 25.3  |         |
| Num recog. 1-20   | 10.6     |        | 29.5  |        | 16.8     |        | 28.0  |         |
| Nothing           | 61.6     |        | 9.1   |        | 41.7     |        | 4.7   |         |
| Total children    | 100%     | 129494 | 100%  | 117588 | 100%     | 119662 | 100%  | 1055011 |
|                   |          | 9      |       | 4      |          | 3      |       | 5       |
| <b>READING</b>    |          |        |       |        |          |        |       |         |
| Para + story      | 1.2      |        | 8.5   |        | 6.4      |        | 24.0  |         |
| Sentence          | 1.7      |        | 13.6  |        | 6.8      |        | 18.2  |         |
| Word              | 7.4      |        | 27.5  |        | 13.8     |        | 26.2  |         |
| Letter            | 31.5     |        | 41.8  |        | 34.5     |        | 27.1  |         |
| Nothing           | 58.3     |        | 8.7   |        | 38.5     |        | 4.5   |         |
| Total children    | 100%     | 129519 | 100%  | 117895 | 100%     | 119806 | 100%  | 1080616 |
|                   |          | 1      |       | 8      |          | 1      |       |         |

Note: Based on data collected and submitted by *Shiksha Mitras* (teachers in Std 1 and 2) of all the Government Primary Schools in the 20 districts.  
Source: UP presentation to the 6<sup>th</sup> Review Mission.